UC-NRLF
B 4 686 507

Municipal Accomplishment in City Planning

and Published City Plan Reports in the United States

EDITED BY
THEODORA KIMBALL Hubbard

Librarian, School of Landscape Architecture, Harvard University
Honorary Librarian, American City Planning Institute

From Information Assembled Largely
by the Detriot City Plan Commission

Published Under the Auspices of
NATIONAL CONFERENCE ON CITY PLANNING
60 State Street, Boston, Mass.
1920

CONTENTS

Page

Introductory Note ---------- 3

Questionnaire Form ---------- 5

Summaries of Questionnaire Replies:

1. City Planning Commissions or Bureaus in operation_ 6
2. City Plans in Progress or Proposed---------- 6
3. Main Lines of Effort in Municipal Improvements—Zoning, Street Extensions, Parks, Port Development, etc. ---------- 6
4. Public Attitude toward City Planning---------- 7
5. Methods of Public Education to Secure Support for a City Plan ---------- 7
6. Suggestions Offered ---------- 8

General Summary of City Planning Experience, prepared by Detroit City Plan Commission ----------11

Index of Cities Included—(121 cities and towns)----------14

Alphabetic List of Cities with

a) Digests of Questionnaire Answers
b) Lists of Published City Plan Reports } ----------15-76

Supplement on Municipal Appropriations for City Planning in 1920 ----------77

INTRODUCTORY NOTE

Since the publication of "City Planning Progress 1917" edited by George B. Ford for the American Institute of Architects (now out of print), there has been no summary issued to show specific city planning accomplishments in our American cities. Although the present bulletin is far more limited in scope than the 1917 book, it nevertheless does show in a striking fashion the character and intensity of municipal activity in city planning at the present time. Early in November of last year, the Detroit City Plan Commission, through T. Glenn Phillips, its Secretary and Consultant, sent out questionnaires to the Mayors of about a hundred cities of the United States and Canada where city planning work, official or otherwise, in the last twenty years, was known to have been represented in one or more published plan reports. Subsequently over twenty-five more questionnairs were issued by the editor to secure information from additional cities and thus make the data assembled as complete as possible within the scope of the undertaking. A copy of the questionnaire is printed on a following page. The Detroit Commission's purpose was to find out how many of these cities have City Plan Commissions or propose to have them, and to get suggestions as to procedure which should be helpful in the work in Detroit. The answers to questions about difficulties encountered, public attitude, and creation of popular interest in improvements all are especially valuable for Commission work.

To share this information with other cities, particularly those which have cooperated by thorough and interesting replies to the questionnaires, the Detroit Commission is contributing to the publication, under the auspices of the National Conference on City Planning, of this bulletin, combining digests of the answers with a list of published reports relating to city planning. This list of reports is made up from the "American City" list (American City Pamphlet No. 124), December 1914, edited by F. L. Olmsted and T. Kimball, an Miss Kimball's lists in "Landscape Architecture" for January 1918 and January 1920, together with all other reports which have come to the notice of the Library of the Harvard School of Landscape Architecture up to November 1, 1920. Unfortunately, owing to the bulk of information and reports relating to cities in the United States, it has not been possible to include Canadian reports in the list, nor the digest of answers

500329

kindly sent by Calgary, Montreal, Ottawa, Toronto, and Winnipeg. For the same reason it has not been possible to include ordinary annual reports, (e. g. for Massachusetts towns such as Somerville and Taunton), nor articles describing plan reports (such as Mr. E. H. Bennett's on Winnetka, Ill. and Mr. John Nolen's on Wayland, Mass., in the "American City"), nor reports on garden suburbs and new industrial towns. Also, in view of the limitations set, there could not be included information at hand as to city plans under way for cities which have not yet issued published plan reports, such as Hamilton and Mansfield, Ohio, Scranton and Sewickley, Pa., East Orange, N. J., Ferndale, Highland Park, Jackson, and Lansing, Mich., and many others. The compilation of answers to the very brief questionnaire just issued to 300 cities by Mr. George B. Ford to secure information for his address at the City Managers' convention should thus prove a useful complement to this present bulletin. It should be noted that for the two states foremost in number of plan commissions, apponted under state laws (Massachusetts and Pennsylvania), 15 Massachusetts and 5 Pennsylvania cities and towns are represented in this list, because of having issued plans in some published form, thus making their proposals or experience available to other cities.

Throughout the bulletin in cases where no answers have been received (after second questionnaires had been sent), this fact has been noted; but if the editor has had recent information from other sources concerning progress in those cities, brief notes have been added for the convenience of readers.

The facts given in the digests have often been used verbatim from the answers; and special pains have been taken to make each digest as representive as possible of the spirit of the reply. Thus the bulletin should not only be useful as a record of projects constructed and of published reports, but also as reflecting the attitude of various American officials towards comprehensive improvement programs. The moral to be pointed above all is that the efforts of committees working for a city plan without cooperation or approval from the city government are usually abortive, and that such bodies would better bend their energies to create so strong a public demand for a city plan that public provision will be made for its preparation and its progressive execution.

THEODORA KIMBALL, Editor.

November 1, 1920.

(QUESTIONNAIRE FORM)

CITY PLAN COMMISSION
403 City Hall,
Detroit, Mich.

Please fill in the following questionnaire so that we may check up just how far cities are following plans established for their future growth. (By plans, we mean comprehensive studies and recommendations made, covering the future growth as to streets, parks, boulevards, recreations, public and semi-public buildings, zoning, etc.) We would like to have this information to assist our Commission in future recommendations to the city.

1. Have you a comprehensive city plan?_____
2. When and how prepared?_____
3. If not, do you anticipate the preparation of one?_____
By what procedure? _____
_____
4. Have improvements been carried out according to a plan?_____State character of such improvements, (Such as street openings, parks, etc.) _____
_____
_____
5. By what Municipal Authority do you operate? (City Plan Commission, Common Council Action or otherwise?)
_____
_____
6. Was a comprehensive city plan prepared prior to appointment of "Municipal Authority" to carry it into execution?
_____
7. What difficulties have you encountered in proceeding with prepared plans? _____
_____
_____
8. Does the public appreciate the value of such plans?_____
9. How do you create popular interest in general city improvements? _____
_____
_____
10. What suggestions have you to offer that would facilitate the actual carrying out of a definite city plan, rather than the usual haphazard growth? _____
_____

SUMMARIES OF QUESTIONNAIRE REPLIES

1. **City Planning Commissions or Bureaus in Operation.**

Of the 87 cities sending replies out of 121 having published reports, 40 have active city planning commissions or bureaus. Twenty-seven cities mention operating by some form of Common Council action. Of the city planning commissions, 9 are noted as advisory only, and 6 as appointed under charter amendment, but the information on these points is obviously incomplete. Strong satisfaction is expressed as to conditions under the charter authority. Only a few cities now without city planning commissions, expressed the hope of establishing them. **The National Conference on City Planning has (November 15, 1920) a record of 148 commissions actually at work in the United States.**

2. **City Plans in Progress or Proposed.**

The results show that, of the 87 cities replying, 53 consider that they have already a comprehensive (or more than partial) city plan, while 19 anticipate the preparation of one. Twelve cities propose to prepare this by a commission of city officials, and 5 cities mention intended employment of experts.

Sixteen cities have no plan and 12 do not intend to have one prepared in the immediate future.

3. **Main Lines of Effort in Municipal Improvements.**

The replies make especial mention as follows:

Zoning: 12 cities. (**Ed. note**: This number is far too small to represent the actual figures of cities which now have or are securing zone plans. See Bulletin on Zoning issued by American Civic Association and forthcoming American City Bureau digest of zoning experience.)

Street openings, extensions, and widenings: 32 cities.

Control of sub-divisions: 7 cities.

Park and playground acquisition: 29 cities.

Rapid transit: 2 cities.

Railroad terminal improvements: 3 cities.

Port development: 3 cities.

River or water front improvement: 3 cities.

Civic centers and public buildings: 6 cities.

Bridges: 5 cities.

Improvement of city entrances: 1 city.

Markets: 1 city.

Tree planting and street parking: 3 cities.

4. **Public Attitude towards City Planning.**

In answer to the question, "Does the Public appreciate such plans?" the following replies are typical:

"We believe the public generally does."—"No."—"To a certain extent."—"Some people have a very keen appreciation of the work, and this number is growing."—"No."—"No, but they seem to like the medicine better after they 'get it down.'" —"Decidedly yes."—"Yes, I believe so, but public have not had an opportunity to study same as only 500 copies were printed."

Thirty-eight cities found public attitude generally favorable and twenty-one cities indifferent or otherwise. Four cities mention a favorable attitude of part of the citizens.

The following will give some idea of the difficulties encountered by the cities:

"No difficulties."—"Finances at present are going through a very critical period."—"Have not been able even to secure appropriations for preparation of plans. This is due wholly to short term political offices."—"Lack funds."—"We live in hopes of home rule for cities with power to raise funds."—"Plans defeated twice."—"Chiefly lack of appropriate legislation."—"Ignorance until shown."—"Lack of cooperation of business interests."—"No proper machinery for getting them executed."—"Lack of education."

The lack of funds seems to be the chief difficulty encountered by cities in carrying out their plans.

5. **Methods of Public Education to Secure Support for a City Plan.**

The following are typical answers to the question: "How do you create popular interest in general city improvements?"

"Publicity campaign, using newspapers, Chamber of Commerce bulletins, posters, window cards, lectures before Civic Societies, etc."—"By proper publicity—newspaper articles, interviews, lectures with lantern slides, sketches, public exhibitions of plans and suggested improvements."—"By patient agitation."—"If it is possible, some day we hope to have an independent citizens' committee (10) subdivided into subcommittees on Public Instruction, Public Safety and Public Works for purposes of study and suggestions."—"Through an advisory Board of 25 citizens."—"Through the press and public meetings."—"By semi-monthly educational programs of our association and publicity in newspapers."—"I do not think

it is necessary any longer to try and create popular interest in general city improvements. That interest exists and is keen. There have been, as in most other cities, projects for comprehensive improvements of a somewhat spectacular nature that have aroused much interest at the time, but these plans have not been official."—"It is very difficult to stimulate interest in any city improvements. About the only improvements that the people appreciate are good roads and pavements and also parks and playgrounds."—"By educational propaganda. We have found considerable interest manifested by civic and business organizations, after the purpose of the plan and work have been explained as we have done by lectures with stereopticon slides, etc."—"Mass meetings."—"Largely through the public press."—"Through practical demonstrations."—"Through existing civic organizations, special campaigns."—"By continuous education."—"There is now a campaign under way to make every citizen a member of some citizen's association" (An association for each district)."—"Lantern lectures to fraternal and labor organizations."—"By illustrated lectures, newspaper stories, and through the public school system."

Most of the cities use the press and public lectures to create public interest in the work they are doing and propose to do. There seems to be a general recognition of the importance of publicity.

6. Suggestions Offered.

The tenth question asked: "What suggestions have you to offer that would facilitate the actual carrying out of a definite city plan, rather than the usual haphazard growth?" brought forth some very interesting answers, among which are:

"First, provide adequate laws, 2nd get every civic and commercial organization, especially the Real Estate Board, to adopt the plan; 3rd get the people to adopt it; By this time there will be a public opinion on the subject. The rest will be simply a matter of financing and turning down subdividers who do not desire to follow the plan."

"In order that all the questions of city planning may be intelligently studied it is absolutely necessary to first prepare an accurate topography map covering the entire city on which to base your plan. We suggest that care be taken that the plans be not too elaborate, but followed along reasonable and conservative lines, using the topography and existing con-

ditions to the fullest extent. Provision should also be made for amending your plan, which is certain to be necessary in course of time. With these main points in view and an honest effort on the part of the city officials to gain the confidence of the general public, a long step is taken in the right direction."

"This requires largely a campaign of education. Such education will lead to an appreciation of the advantages of a carefully prepared plan, the legislation necessary to enforce it, and the appropriation of money sufficient to carry on the work."

"I am in favor of a city plan commission of an advisory character."

"The plans should be prepared under the authority of the body that has the power to carry out the plan. A commission or body that has no power to carry out their own plans will find their work doubly hard."

"Change in form of city government to City Manager Plan."

"By putting men in office who realize the advantage of working to definite lines. It is a distinctive advantage to have a comprehensive plan—not to follow slavishly as conditions change, but as a means of getting people interested in particular improvements. It takes time to educate the public."

"Acceptance of principles of a 'Zoning plan,' city ordinances prohibiting construction or platting at variance with defined principles of such a plan, laws providing for 'Excess condemnation' for public improvements, and a law providing for the placing on the city plan of 'deferred' projects as in Philadelphia."

"Have your commission go ahead and formulate its plans, carry them out, and then the public will approve when they see the accomplished fact. Visualization is absolutely necessary to the public." (**Ed. query:** What is source of funds for carrying out plans prior to public approval?)

"The establishment of an official authorized planning committee, financed by the city."

"City Planning Commissions and the consideration of their recommendations should be provided for in city charters backed up by State laws instead of being created by ordinances. City plans should be promoted by proper publicity."

"Official adoption by City Administration of such definite City plan and carrying out contemplated improvements by

city departments affected. The City Planning Commission serves as advisory board and inaugurates the improvements."

"The methods of procedure in this city (New York) have been fairly satisfactory and what I consider to be one of the wisest of our policies is that of assessing a proper portion of the expense of every improvement upon the property benefited. This often checks the enthusiam for projects involving great outlay which would result in large local benefit without corresponding contribution by the owners of the property benefited. It does not, however, check interest in and the demand for reasonable improvements in the City Plan."

"First get a good comprehensive plan and then enlist the cooperation of the City Council and Mayor in conforming improvements to the new plan."

"To have plans drawn by competent engineers aided by suggestions from landscape architects; also from local citizens who know the city and have its interest at heart."

"City Planning Board backed by an educated public—Public meetings and newspaper discussion—Frank, open appeal to all City Departments."

"Education of the public on the matters proposed and why. Public sentiment is all that is necessary, and that is very easy to get if you show the people what you propose to do, as I have always found the tax-payer willing to pay provided he can see what he is going to get."

"Ample authority to the commission, unrestrained by petty politics. Support of the courts in matters of assessment."

"An official commission with long terms for members."

"Work to secure public sentiment in favor of carrying out certain attractive features of the city plan. If such features turn out to be valuable improvements, we feel that little trouble will be encountered in the carrying out of the balance."

"A separate Citizen's Advisory Committee to cooperate with the City Planning Committee (or Commission) may be appointed. What is needed most is men who are interested in the work and who will give time and study to it so that their advice will be worth something."

"A City Planning Commission, employing the services of an expert on City plan, with money enough at his disposal to make a careful survey of the city, is an excellent way of ascertaining the needs of the City for city planning, and of educating the public to desire it."

"Adopt city plan by Ordinance and work accordingly."

"Work along lines of Chicago Plan Commission in interesting organizations."

"Study of plans of other cities, which have had experience."

"Establish an intimate touch with the public through direct representation on an advisory body in aid of city plan and by calling to aid all possible publicity measures and agencies."

"Get backing of state and city laws. Make compulsory to comply with general plan."

"Give the City Planning Commission **authority.** Get the public confidence."

GENERAL SUMMARY OF CITY PLANNING EXPERIENCE

Prepared by Detroit City Plan Commission

The questionnaires collectively indicate that a large number of cities (53) already have a so called "comprehensive" city plan, though very few cities are working according to a definite plan. This is possibly the combined influence of planning in advance of approval or authority from the city government; planning too elaborate or idealistic schemes; lack of sufficient powers vested in a City Plan Commission, or insufficient funds to carry out the plan.

The powers and duties of each Plan Commission, together with the number of Commissioners, personnel and appropriations will naturally vary to accommodate the local requirements of each city, nevertheless for all cities that may be establishing or reorganizing City Plan Commissions the following procedure and suggestions have been compiled:—

(1) **Provide that the City Plan Commission be a part of the city government.** Charter Provision is recommended by Detroit.

(2) **Create a Commission with definitely established authority** and powers. In experience in Detroit, a Commission acting merely as an advisory body is seriously handicapped in constructive City Planning Work.

(3) **Commission personnel,** serving without compensation and composed of public-spirited, energetic citizens, established in the principal business and professional activities of the community. A nine-man commission is extremely satisfactory.

(4) **Appointment.** By the Mayor.

(5) **Term of office.** Three years, with a minority retiring each year, in order that new appointees may more easily coalesce with the general procedure and policies of the Commission.

(6) **Office personnel.** Serving with remuneration, preferably under the guidance of a consultant or expert on city planning who should be resident on the work. The number of draftsmen, clerks and other office personnel will necessarily vary according to the activities and appropriation of each Commission. Their appointment should be under Civil Service.

(7) **Commission meetings and records.** The Commission should meet regularly. It should adopt its own rules of procedure and keep a record of its proceedings, receipts and disbursements.

(8) **Committees.** It is desirable to form committees within the Commission to cover the main phases of the work. Such committees may meet regularly, or subject to call, to investigate details and report their findings at the regular meetings of the Commission for definite action. Suggestions for committees would include, Executive; Streets and Plats; Parks, Boulevards and Recreation; Arts and Architecture; Zoning; or for any special activities such as Waterfront Development, Transportation, etc.

(9) **General powers and duties of the Commission.**

(a) The securing of a comprehensive City Plan, under the advice of competent experts.

(b) Approval of all new plats within and for a distance of several miles beyond the City Limits.

(c) Investigation and approval of all lands to be acquired by the City.

(d) Approval of all street openings or widenings.

(e) Approval of the location of all public buildings, memorials, bridges or other public structures. The approval of the design of public structures although an Art Commission function, in Detroit resides in the City Plan Commission. In Detroit also all landscape designs and planting plans for city parks, boulevards or public properties are prepared by the Plan Commission.

(f) Preparation of a zoning plan and accompanying maps, with power and authority to enforce its

provisions after approval and adoption by the Legislative Body.

(g) Close co-operation with all other branches of the City Government.

(10) **Annual estimate.** The Commission should transmit each year to the City Controller on or before a specified date, an estimate of expenditures required for the ensuing fiscal year.

(11) **Annual report.** The Commission should transmit each year to the Mayor on or before a specified date, a report of the work of the Commission during the year. The Commission should make such other reports as the Legislative Body may require.

INDEX OF CITIES INCLUDED

*Akron, O.
*Albany, N. Y.
*Alton, Ill.
*Altus, Okla.
*Auburn, Me.
Aurora, Ill.

*Baltimore, Md.
*Bangor, Me.
*Berkeley, Calif.
*Billerica, Mass.
*Binghamton, N. Y.
*Birmingham, Ala.
*Boston, Mass.
*Boulder, Colo.
Bridgeport, Conn.
*Brockton, Mass.
*Brookline, Mass.
*Buffalo, N. Y.

*Cambridge, Mass.
*Cedar Rapids, Ia.
†Champaign-Urbana, Ill.
Chattanooga, Tenn.
*Chicago, Ill.
*Cincinnati, O.
*Cleveland, O.
Cohoes, N. Y.
*Colorado Springs, Colo.
Columbia, S. C.
*Columbus, O.
*Council Bluffs, Ia.

*Dallas, Tex.
*Davenport, Ia.
Dayton, O.
Denver, Colo.
Des Moines, Ia.
*Detroit, Mich.
*Dover, N. J.
Dubuque, Ia.

*East St. Louis, Ill.
*Elgin, Ill.
*Erie, Pa.
*Evanston, Ill.

*Fall River, Mass.
*Fayetteville, N. Y.
*Fitchburg, Mass.
*Flint, Mich.
Fort Wayne, Ind.

Glen Ridge, N. J.
†Grand Canyon, Ariz.
*Grand Rapids, Mich.
Greenville, S. C.

*Answer received.

†Questionnaire not sent.

*Harrisburg, Pa.
*Hartford, Conn.
Honolulu, Hawaii
Houston, Tex.

Indianapolis, Ind.
*Ithaca, N. Y.

*Jamestown, N. Y.
*Jersey City, N. J.
*Johnstown, Pa.

*Kansas City, Mo.

La Crosse, Wis.
*Lawrence, Mass.
Little Rock, Ark.
*Los Angeles, Calif.

Madison, N. J.
*Madison, Wis.
*Manila, P. I.
*Milwaukee, Wis.
*Minneapolis, Minn.
*Montclair, N. J.

*New Haven, Conn.
*New London, Conn.
*New York City
*Newark, N. J.
*Newton, Mass.
Newport, R. I.
*Niagara Falls, N. Y.
*Norfolk, Va.

Oakland, Calif.
*Ogdensburg, N. Y.
Oklahoma City, Okla.
*Omaha, Neb.

Paris, Tex.
*Pasadena, Calif.
*Peoria, Ill.
*Philadelphia, Pa.
Pittsburgh, Pa.
*Portland, Ore.
*Providence, R. I.
*Pueblo, Colo.

*Quincy, Mass.

*Raleigh, N. C.
*Reading, Pa.
*Ridgewood, N. J.
*Roanoake, Va.
*Rochester, N. Y.
*Rockford, Ill.

Sacramento, Calif.
*St. Louis, Mo.
St. Paul, Minn.
Salem, Mass.
*San Diego, Calif.
San Francisco, Calif.
*San Jose, Calif.
*Santa Barbara, Calif.
*Santa Fe, New Mex.
*Seattle, Wash.
*Spokane, Wash.
*Springfield, Mass.
Stillwater, Minn.
*Syracuse, N. Y.

*Trenton, N. J.

*Utica, N. Y.

*Walpole, Mass.
*Washington, D. C.
Waterbury, Conn.
*Waterloo, Ia.
Watertown, N. Y.
Winchester, Mass.
Worcester, Mass.

*Answer received.

†Questionnaire not sent.

ALPHABETIC LIST OF CITIES, with

a) Digests of Answers to Questionnaires

b) Lists of Published City Plan Reports

AKRON, OHIO.

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

A comprehensive city plan, prepared 1917-1919 by John Nolen for the Chamber of Commerce, under consideration, being reviewed by the Planning Commission. Planning Commission recommends; City Council legislates. Publicity campaign conducted, using newspapers, Chamber of Commerce bulletins, posters, window cards, lectures before civic societies, etc.

REPORTS:

Nolen, John. City plan for Akron; prepared for Chamber of Commerce, 1919.

Williams, Frank Backus. Akron and its planning law. Akron Chamber of Commerce, 1919.

Akron City Planning Commission. Rules and regulations governing the platting of land, adopted June 15, 1920. July, 1920. Bul. no. 1. (A. S. DeForest, special adviser).

ALBANY, NEW YORK

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

No comprehensive city plan, but comprehensive studies for sections and particular improvements, made by Arnold W. Brunner and Charles Downing Lay, 1912-1914, working in consultation with the Commissioner of Public Works and with the City Engineer. Many of the improvements have been carried out: street widenings, park developments, creation of a Plaza, the improvement of the river front, city entrances, etc. Common Council authorized employment of consultants. No difficulties encountered in proceeding with prepared plans, public appreciating their value. Publicity methods: newspaper articles, interviews, illustrated lectures, sketches, public exhibition of plans and suggested improvements.

REPORTS:

Ware, Franklin B., State Architect. The architectural development of Capitol Hill by the construction of Department buildings and the extension of the park system. 1911.

Albany Chamber of Commerce. Report of Committee appointed to suggest a plan for the improvement of the river front. 1911.

Brunner, Arnold W., and **Charles Downing Lay.** Studies for Albany. 1914.

ALTON, ILLINOIS

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

No comprehensive plan, and none at present contemplated, owing to critical financial situation. City Council the municipal authority for improvements. A percentage of public appreciates the value of plans. Popular interest in general city improvements created by mass meetings, illustrated lectures, and large committees for personal approach.

REPORTS:

Robinson, Charles Mulford. The advancement of Alton. A general city plan study for the Board of Trade. 1914.

ALTUS, OKLAHOMA

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

No comprehensive city plan, but preparation of one anticipated. Board of Aldermen the municipal authority for improvements.

REPORTS:

Jensen, L. P. Preliminary report to Altus Chamber of Commerce. "In Altus, Oklahoma." Published by Hooker-Wishart Investment Co. 1910.

AUBURN, MAINE

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

City has a city plan prepared in 1918. City operates under manager form of charter, and has plan commission. Difficulty felt that "plan is too visionary, not all practical." Public appreciative.

REPORTS:

West, Myron H. Text of the city plan for Auburn, Maine, 1919. (Published in Lewiston (Maine) Journal. Auburn-Lewiston, April 14, 1920.)

AURORA, ILLINOIS

No answer received.

REPORTS:

West, Myron H. A system of parks for Aurora. Chicago, American Park Builders. 1918.

BALTIMORE, MARYLAND

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

Has comprehensive plan. The following is quoted from the answer by Maj. Joseph W. Shirley, Chief Engineer, and Chairman, City Plan Committee:

"In 1888 Baltimore doubled its area by adding approximately 16 square miles. As soon as this was accomplished a very careful topographical map covering the entire city was prepared and a General Plan of Streets was adopted for the newly added territory. In about 1830 a general street plan had already been adopted for the older portion of the city and had been very carefully followed. In 1902 a general Park Plan recommended by Olmsted Brothers was adopted by the City, and conformed to the General Plan of Streets which had been adopted a few years before. For the enforcement of the Street Plan the State Legislature, at the request of the City, passed an Act which prohibited the City of Baltimore from accepting as public, either by condemnation, dedication or otherwise, any street that did not conform to the General Plan of Streets for the Annex or that Plan duly amended by general action of the Topographical Survey Commission (originator of the Plan) and the Mayor and City Council of Baltimore. This Law has been very effective in enforcing developments along the lines laid down on the Street Plan.

"By an Act of the Legislature of 1918 Baltimore again extended its limits and added to its territory about 60 square miles, making a total of about 90 square miles within the corporate limits.

"In October 1918 a City Plan Committee was appointed by the Topographical Survey Commission, (which Commission is composed of the Mayor, Comptroller and Register this Committee consisting of the Chief Engineer to the Topographical Survey Commission, as Chairman, an architect not connected with the City Government, as Secretary, and the Harbor Engineer as the third member. This Committee was

authorized to prepare a comprehensive plan for the development of the entire city, and was authorized to employ as consultants the firm of Carrère & Hastings, of New York City. This General Plan was completed on May 1st, 1919, and covered a Street System, a Plan for the Development of the Harbor, Extension of the Park System, and recommendations for increased railroad and rapid transit facilities.

"By an Act of the Legislature of 1910 a Commission on City Plan was authorized and afterwards appointed, but this Commission has only acted in an advisory capacity, in a few instances, and has not been active for the past few years.

"[Fall, 1919], the new Mayor of Baltimore, who has taken his seat since May 1st, 1919, appointed an Annex Advisory Commission to consider the General Plan as submitted by the City Plan Committee and to make recommendations as to ways and means for the development of the territory recently added."

"All improvements such as street openings, land development, park extensions, etc., have been carried out in accordance with the plans originally adopted."

"Of course the opposition generally met by developers of private lands is evident in Baltimore as elsewhere, but an effort has been made, which has been apparently successful, to obtain the cooperation, confidence and good will of these developers, the City being always ready to meet them on any fair grounds and assist them in every possible way to work out a satisfactory development. With the provisions as mentioned [above] for amendments to the Plan and with the Law prohibiting the City from accepting as public streets that do not conform to the Plan, we believe that in Baltimore we have accomplished as much as has been accomplished in any other city."

Public generally does appreciate value of city plans, and has been informed by newspaper publicity and by conferences and discussions.

REPORTS:

Olmsted Bros. Development of public grounds for Greater Baltimore. 1904.

Baltimore Burnt District Commission. Report to the Mayor for the six months ending Sept. 11, 1906.

Municipal Art Society of Baltimore. Partial report on City Plan. (Advisory Commission, Carrère, Brunner and Olmsted.) 1910.

Baltimore Topographical Survey Commission. Reports to the Mayor and City Council for the years ending 1911, 1912.

Baltimore City Plan Committee. Report on the development of the territory added under the Act of 1918, together with recommendations and suggestions on the railroad, rapid transit, and harbor problems of the city. **In** Baltimore Municipal Journal, May 9, 1919.

BANGOR, MAINE

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

No official plan. Preparation not contemplated immediately —"other things of greater importance require attention." City council the authority for improvements.

REPORTS:

Manning, Warren H. and **Bangor Civic Improvement Committee.** Bangor City Plan: The burned district. (Joint report) 1911.

BERKELEY, CALIFORNIA

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

"We have a comprehensive zone law, prepared by our City Planning Commission, with the advice of Charles H. Cheney, our Consultant. Our City Planning Commission has also prepared a comprehensive plan for street openings, widenings, etc. None of these improvements have as yet been carried out as the plan was accepted only this summer (1920) and the Council has decided to wait until the cost of street work is normal before saddling the expenses involved upon the property owners. We have a City Planning Commission appointed by the Council, which acts in an advisory capacity and recommends to our Council, which takes final action. The difficulties we have had have come from those who believe that one should do with his property as he sees fit irrespective of its effect upon his neighbor, and it has taken a long time to overcome the opposition of this point of view. A consistent campaign of education has been carried on for several years and has finally borne fruit. Our Community is un-

doubtedly in favor of city planning as it has been done."—Louis Bartlett, Mayor.

REPORTS:

Berkeley Civic Art Commission. First annual report. July, 1916.

Hegemann, Werner. Report on a city plan for the municipalities of Oakland and Berkeley. Prepared and published under the auspices of the municipal governments of Oakland and Berkeley, the Supervsors of Alameda County, the Chamber of Commerce and Commercial Club of Oakland, the Civic Art Commission of Berkeley, the City Club of Berkeley. 1915.

BILLERICA, MASSACHUSETTS

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

Comprehensive development studies for town (3000 population) by Warren H. Manning, also chairman of local Park Commission. A number of park improvements carried out, without special difficulties and with public appreciation. Popular interest created by Community days, newspaper articles, and occasional exhibitions of plans.

REPORTS:

Manning, Warren H. The Billerica Town Plan. Published in "Billerica," 1912-1913 (and in "Landscape Architecture," April, 1913.)

BINGHAMTON, NEW YORK

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

No comprehensive city plan. Unable even to secure appropriations for preparation of plans, due wholly to short-term political offices. Common Council the municipal authority. The public does not appreciate the value of plans. If possible, it is hoped to have an independent citizens' committee (10) subdivided in subcommittees on Public Instruction, Public Safety and Public Works, for purposes of study and suggestion.

REPORTS:

Robinson, Charles Mulford. Better Binghamton. A report to the Mercantile Press Club of Binghamton. 1911.

BIRMINGHAM, ALABAMA

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

"We have not developed a city plan and, hence, I cannot and do not fill out the questionnaire."—Commissioner of Public Improvements.

REPORTS:

Manning, Warren H. City Plan of Birmingham. Published by subscription in Birmingham, 1919. (Based on a comprehensive regional study.)

BOSTON, MASSACHUSETTS

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

Comprehensive plans have been made for certain sections of the City. "Boston is made up of units, i. e., Charlestown, Roxbury, Dorchester, East Boston, South Boston, West Roxbury, Brighton, etc., each unit having certain individual problems peculiar to itself. A complete survey has been made of East Boston and the North End, and work is under way in the South Boston section. It is expected that these individual reports will serve as parts of a general comprehensive plan covering the entire city when circumstances permit. While working upon the separate sections, the needs of the whole community are kept constantly in mind, and their relation, one to the other." Several playgrounds have been established in accordance with recreation survey. Surveys and recommendations are made by City Planning Board, established by municipal ordinance in accordance with state legislative Act providing that all cities with over 10,000 inhabitants should establish planning boards. Principal difficulties encountered is lack of funds to carry out plans. Public appreciation limited, but growing. Public education by means of illustrated lectures, cooperation with Chamber of Commerce and civic organizations, newspaper publicity, and exhibitions.

REPORTS:

Boston Society of Architects. Report of Committee on Municipal Improvements. 1907.

Kellaway, Herbert J. Report on proposed park and parkways from Charles River Reservation to West Roxbury. 1908.

Metropolitan Improvement Commission. Report, 1909.

Joint Board on Metropolitan Improvements. Final report. 1910.

Metropolitan Plan Commission. Report. 1912.

United Improvement Association. Suggested system of main thoroughfares for Boston. 1913.

Boston Chamber of Commerce. Street traffic in the City of Boston. A study made under the direction of the governing board of the Under Forty Division, Boston Chamber of Commerce. 1914.

Boston City Planning Board. Larger aspects of passenger transportation in Metropolitan Boston. Report to the Massachusetts Public Service Commission. 1914.

____East Boston, a survey and a comprehensive plan. Prepared by George Gibbs, Jr., February, 1915. Published 1916.

____A summary of the market situation in Boston; preliminary report of the Market Advisory Committee, June, 1915. Published 1916.

Boston Port Directors. Supplementary report, March 31, 1915.

Clapp, Edwin J. The Port of Boston; a study and a solution of the traffic and operating problems of Boston. New Haven, Yale University Press, 1916. (An outgrowth of a private report made to the Directors of the Port of Boston, preceding their Supplementary report.)

Boston. Commission on Height of Buildings. Report, November 2, 1916.

Boston City Planning Board. The North End; a survey and a comprehensive plan. 1919. (Henry L. Whitney, investigator.)

BOULDER, COLORADO

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

Partial plan, prepared by Olmsted Brothers. Comprehensive plan to be prepared through recently created Planning and Parks Commission operating under authority of City Charter. Improvements according to Olmsted plan partially

carried out: acquiring land for parks, street openings, width of roadways and parkings for paved streets. Popular interest created through press and public meetings, but not yet time to judge of current public appreciation or public opposition.

REPORTS:

Olmsted, Frederick Law. The improvement of Boulder, Colorado. Report to City Improvement Association. March, 1910.

BRIDGEPORT, CONNECTICUT

No answer received.

REPORTS:

Nolen, John. Preliminary report to the City Plan Commission, with supplementary material. 1915.

____Better city planning for Bridgeport; some fundamental proposals to the City Plan Commission--With a report on legal methods of carrying out the changes proposed in the city plan for Bridgeport, by Frank Backus Williams. 1916. (Contains substance of Mr. Nolen's More Houses for Bridgeport, August, 1916.)

BROCKTON, MASSACHUSETTS

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

Suggestions for comprehensive city plan prepared by A. C. Comey for City Planning Board 1915, and program of procedure, 1918. Board has also employed Mr. Comey to prepare a tentative zoning ordinance which the Board hopes to get adopted in the Fall of 1920. City Planning Board is municipal authority. Chief difficulty is lack of public sentiment although appreciation of plans just beginning. Interest created through local press and municipal authorities.

REPORTS:

Brockton City Planning Board. Annual reports. (2d, 1915, contains comprehensive plan study, and 5th, 1918, contains procedure program.)

____Suggested form for Zoning Ordinance. Brockton, Mass., 1920. As recommended by the City Planning Board. (Arthur C. Comey, consultant.)

BROOKLINE, MASSACHUSETTS

DIGEST OF ANSWER:
No city plan, but Planning Board under Massachusetts State Law, which has taken up certain city planning problems. (Zoning plan in progress.)

REPORTS:

Brookline Planning Board. Annual reports. 2d, 1915, contains building line studies.

BUFFALO, NEW YORK

DIGEST OF ANSWER:
Work on civic center and zoning system going on from early 1919 by City Planning Committee of Six, composed of City Officials (sub-heads) appointed by Commission Government. Many improvements carried out by separate planning heretofore with some regard to connective unity, which will be materially advanced by operation of City Planning Committee. "Stage of difficulties" not yet reached. Public beginning to appreciate value of plans, and considerable interest manifested by civic and business organizations, after illustrated lectures. Civic organizations have appointed an Advisory Citizens' Committee to cooperate with official City Planning Committee on civic center. Its moral support highly beneficial. (At general election of November 2, 1920, referendum question of civic center voted on favorably by plurality of 12.000.)

REPORTS:

Robinson, Charles Mulford. Report to the Society for Beautifying Buffalo. 1902.

Cary, George. The grouping of public buildings and gardens with adjoining water front, excursion docks, and Union Station for the City of Buffalo. 1905.

Buffalo City Planning Committee of "The Council." First annual report. October 30, 1918-December 31, 1919.

CAMBRIDGE, MASSACHUSETTS

DIGEST OF ANSWER:
No comprehensive plan and none anticipated. [**Ed. note.** City has Planning Board under state law. Studies prepared as

noted below and zoning study in progress, Arthur C. Comey, consultant.]

REPORTS:

Harvard University. Committee on Harvard Square. The future development of Harvard Square and its neighborhood. Report of a committee appointed at the request of the Mayor of Cambridge. 1913.

Cambridge Planning Board. Annual reports (1st, 1915, contains special survey maps.)

____Improvement of traffic conditions in Harvard Square: Report of the Planning Board. 1920. (Arthur C. Comey, consultant.)

____Zoning for Cambridge. Report of the Planning Board, 1920. (Arthur C. Comey, consultant.)

CEDAR RAPIDS, IOWA

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

Only a suggestive plan by Charles Mulford Robinson, in 1908, which has been used as a guide in a general way and a great deal done since that time along these lines. Municipal authority for improvements entirely under City Council operating under Commission Form of Government. The preparation of the city plan was one of the first acts of the first Commission Council. Plans were not explicit enough to cause any particular difficulties. "In addition to City Council a River Front Improvement Commission has made some progress towards permanently improving the banks of the river flowing through the city; but on account of radical measures adopted by them, the whole matter has gone into the courts for adjudication, delaying work along that line." Public seems to appreciate value of plans.

REPORTS:

Robinson, Charles Mulford. Report with regard to civic affairs, with recommendations for city improvement and beautification. 1908. (To the Mayor and City Council.)

CHAMPAIGN-URBANA, ILLINOIS

No questionnaire sent.

REPORTS:

University of Illinois. Department of Horticulture. Notes for a study in city planning in Champaign-Urbana, by the 1913 and 1914 classes in civic design at the University of Illinois. Prepared under the direction of Professor Charles Mulford Robinson. Published 1915.

CHATTANOOGA, TENNESSEE

No answer received. [Several park tracts acquired according to plan.]

REPORTS:

Nolen, John. General features of a park system for Chattanooga. Report to the Park Commission. Boston, 1911.

CHICAGO, ILLINOIS

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

Chicago Plan Commission ("guardian and promoter of the Plan," appointed by City Council, 1909) refers for answer to recent book by W. D. Moody, Managing Director, "What of the City? The Plan of Chicago," which summarizes fully the progress on Chicago's comprehensive city plan, prepared by D. H. Burnham and E. H. Bennett (in 1909). Notable features under construction or in advanced stages of legal procedure are: Roosevelt Road (Twelfth Street) and Michigan Avenue widening and extension; the West Side passenger and freight terminal projects; South Shore Lake Front improvements; Illinois Central Railroad terminal rehabilitation; widening or extension of Western Avenue, Ashland Avenue, Robey Street, Ogden Avenue, and South Water Street; acquisition of Forest Preserves; improvement of outer highway system. November 4, 1919, the voters of Chicago passed $28,600,000 worth of bond issues for six Chicago Plan improvements by majorities of nearly a hundred thousand.

REPORTS:

Chicago Special Park Commission. Report to the City Council on a metropolitan park system. 1904.

Commercial Club of Chicago. Plan for a boulevard to connect the north and south sides of the river on Michigan avenue and Pine street. 1908.

____Plan of Chicago, by Daniel H. Burnham and Edward H. Bennett; ed. by Charles Moore. 1909. **("The Chicago Plan.")**

Chicago Harbor Commission. Report to the Mayor and Aldermen. 1909.

Chicago Plan Commission. Chicago's greatest issue; an official plan. 1911.

Arnold, Bion J. Recommendations and general plans for a comprehensive passenger subway system for Chicago. Report to Mayor and City Council Committee on Local Transportation. 1911.

Mohler, Charles K. Report on passenger subway and elevated railway development in Chicago. Prepared for the Committee on Traffic and Transportation of the City Club of Chicago. 1912.

Chicago Harbor and Subway Commission. Joint report on comprehensive system of passenger subways, by the Harbor and Subway Commission and Sub-committee of the Council, Committee on Local Transportation. 1912.

____Report on dock and pier development, harbor district No. 1. 1912.

Moody, Walter Dwight. Wacker's Manual of the plan of Chicago; municipal economy. 1912. (Also Teachers' hand book.) New edition, 1916.

Chicago Plan Commission. Creating a world famous street; argument of Charles H. Wacker, chairman, in behalf of widening and extending Michigan Avenue to properly connect the North and South sides of Chicago. 1913.

City Club of Chicago. The railway terminal problems of Chicago; a series of addresses before the City Club. 1913.

Wallace, John F. Report to the Committee on Railway Terminals of the City Council of Chicago. 1913.

Arnold, Bion J. Report on the re-arrangement and development of the steam railroad terminals of Chicago. Submitted to the Citizens' Terminal Plan Committee of Chicago. November, 1913.

Hooker, George Ellsworth. Through routes for Chicago's steam railroads; the best means for attaining popular and comfortable travel for Chicago and suburbs. Published by the City Club of Chicago. 1914.

Chicago Commission on Down-town Municipal Improvements. Progress report on relief for sub-surface congestion in the down-town Chicago streets. Alvord & Burdick, engineers. L. A. Dumond, Secretary-Engineer for the Commission. 1914.

Chicago Association of Commerce. Committee of Investigation on Smoke Abatement and Electrification of Railway Terminals. Report, with recommendations. (Chicago, Rand, McNally & Co., 1915.)

Chicago Railway Terminal Commission. Preliminary report to City Council Committee on Railway Terminals. March, 1915.

Chicago Traction and Subway Commission. Report to Mayor and City Council on a unified system of surface, elevated and subway lines. 1916.

Chicago Plan Commission. Chicago can get fifty million dollars for nothing! How it can be done by building the South Shore lakefront park lands. 1916.

____Reclaim South Water Street for all the people. November, 1917.

Chicago City Council. Building districts and restrictions; a bill for an act granting to cities and villages in the State of Illinois power to create residential, business and industrial districts or zones. Recommended by the City Council to the General Assembly of Illinois for enactment into a law. And a statement of the desirability of giving Chicago power to create building districts. 1917.

Chicago Bureau of Public Efficiency. Excess condemnation. Why Chicago should have the power, in making public improvements, to take property in excess of actual requirements. Lessons to be drawn from certain unfortunate aspects of the Twelfth Street and Michigan Avenue widening projects and the proposed Ogden Avenue extension. 1918.

Chicago Plan Commission. Reconstruction platform of Chicago Plan Commission. December, 1918.

Moody, Walter D. What of the City? America's greatest issue—city planning, what it is and how to go about it to achieve success. Chicago, A. C. McClurg & Co., 1919. (Summary of Chicago Plan work.)

Citizens' Zone Plan Conference. Chicago, December 16-17, 1919. Report of proceedings.

Chicago Plan Commission. Ten years work of the Commission, 1909-1919, a résumé of the work on the plan of Chicago. Proceedings of the 19th meeting of the Chicago Plan Commission. April, 1920.

CINCINNATI, OHIO

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

No comprehensive city plan yet, but when engineer completes plats of city now in preparation, Commission will take action. City Plan Commission acts under powers conferred by new city charter. Civic organizations to attempt to raise funds for plans and educational campaign.

REPORTS:

Cincinnati Park Commission. A park system for Cincinnati. Report by George E. Kessler of The Park Commission to the Board of Public Service. 1907.

Arnold, Bion J. Report on an interurban electric railway terminal system for Cincinnati. Report submitted to the Cincinnati Interurban Rapid Transit Commission. 1912.

CLEVELAND, OHIO

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

Comprehensive plan now in course of preparation. A preliminary study made by experts (R. H. Whitten, consultant) in collaboration with representatives of various localities. Resulting plan then to be legally adopted by City Council. Group plan (1903), or civic center, has been partially carried out. Present authority is City Plan Commission. Chief difficulties encountered in lack of appropriate legislation and frequent conflict with constitutional questions. It is expected to carry on a sweeping publicity campaign to popularize the

plans as they mature, establishing advisory body directly representing public to aid plan and securing cooperation of all publicity agencies.

REPORTS:

Cleveland Board of Supervision for Public Buildings and Grounds. The group plan of the public buildings of Cleveland. Report to the Mayor and Board of Public Service by Board of Supervision, Messrs. Burnham, Carrère and Brunner. New York, 1903. 2nd edition, 1907.

Cleveland Chamber of Commerce. The Union Station on the Lake Front? or on the Public Square? December, 1918.

Barclay Parsons & Clapp. Report on a rapid transit system for the city of Cleveland, made to the Board of Rapid Transit Commissioners. 1919.

Cleveland Metropolitan Park District. First annual report. 1919. (W. A. Stinchcomb, engineer; F. L. Olmsted, advisory.)

Haynes, Rowland, and **Stanley P. Davies.** Public provision for recreation. Cleveland Foundation Committee. 1920. (Cleveland Recreation Survey.)

COHOES, NEW YORK

No answer received.

REPORTS:

Cohoes Public Improvement Commission. Report, from June, 1896-November, 1904.

COLORADO SPRINGS, COLORADO

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

Has comprehensive city plan prepared by Charles Mulford Robinson, 1908. Improvements partly carried out: center parking, etc. City Planning Commission (Advisory to City Council) as now organized does not function, and change in organization anticipated. Public does not appreciate value of city plans.

REPORTS:

Robinson, Charles Mulford. A report for Colorado Springs, and El Paso Good Roads Association, on the development of the streets. 1905.

____A general plan for the improvement of Colorado Springs. Report to the Department of Public Works and Property. May, 1912.

Colorado Springs Union Depot Commission. Summary of official reports for the years 1912-1913.

COLUMBIA, SOUTH CAROLINA

No answer received.

REPORTS:

Kelsey & Guild. Improvement of Columbia. Report to the Civic League. Harrisburg, Pa. 1905.

COLUMBUS, OHIO

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

No comprehensive city plan, but preparation of one contemplated. Municipal authority, City Charter. Plans twice defeated.

REPORTS:

Columbus Plan Commission. The Plan of Columbus; report to the Mayor, Board of Public Service and City Council, by Austin W. Lord, Albert Kesley, Charles N. Lowrie, Charles Mulford Robinson, H. A. McNeil, Plan Commission. 1908.

COUNCIL BLUFFS, IOWA

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

No comprehensive city plan and none anticipated.

REPORTS:

Robinson, Charles Mulford. Report on a park system for Council Bluffs, made to the Board of Park Commissioners. 1913.

DALLAS, TEXAS

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

Comprehensive city plan prepared by George E. Kessler in 1911. Improvements have been carried out according to it,—a few streets widened, several parks secured. The city plan was prepared prior to appointment of municipal authority

(City Plan Commission) to carry it into execution. Difficulties encountered in insufficient finances. Public does appreciate value of plans, popular interest having been created through the press.

REPORTS:

Kessler, George E. A city plan for Dallas. Report of Park Board. 1911.

Dallas Property Owners' Association. The Union Station District; its present condition and its possibilities. June, 1919. Bul. no. 2 of the Association.

____The Trinity River Problem. March, 1920. Bul no. 3 of the Association.

DAVENPORT, IOWA

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

Comprehensive city plan was prepared (1918) by Roscoe K. Earle, City Engineer. Improvements have been carried out: —parkway 2½ miles long (land acquired), 2 street openings, 1 traffic way. Municipal authority is Common Council action. Public appreciates value of plans. Popular interest created by newspaper articles fully setting forth desirability of improvements. (Note change of name of City Engineer, since 1918.)

REPORTS:

Sawistowsky, Roscoe Earle (City Engineer). Report to the Mayor and City Council on city planning for Davenport. 1918.

DAYTON, OHIO

No answer received.

REPORTS:

Olmsted Bros. Report on proposed park system for Dayton. 1911.

DENVER, COLORADO

No answer received.

REPORTS:

Robinson, Charles Mulford. Proposed plans for the improvement of Denver. Prepared for the Art Commission. 1906.

Special Committee on Proposed Improvements in Denver. Report, 1907.

Olmsted, Frederick Law and **Arnold W. Brunner.** Preliminary report on Denver civic center to Board of Park Commissioners. Published in "City of Denver," August 3, 1912.

Bennett, Edward H. The Denver civic center plan. 1917. (Pamphlet issued by Denver City Service Bureau.)

DES MOINES, IOWA

No answer received. (Important northwestern diagonal thoroughfare in progress of construction, according to plan of Town Planning Committee.)

REPORTS:

Des Moines Town Planning Committee. Capitol extension plan; Park, boulevard and traffic way system; The civic center. (Poster, with text.) 1920.

DETROIT, MICHIGAN

DIGEST OF ANSWER: (Prepared in Detroit)
Comprehensive city plan actively in progress by City Plan Commission (operating since March 1919 under new city charter, T. Glenn Phillips, Consultant and Secretary) continuing partial work of advisory body known as Detroit City Plan and Improvement Commission, created by ordinance in 1909.

The new charter (January, 1919) provides that there shall be a City Plan Commission of nine members, citizens of the United States and residents of Detroit, who shall be appointed by the Mayor and shall include an architect, civil engineer, structural engineer, real estate dealer, builder, attorney and physician, to hold office without compensation for a term of three years,—three commissioners retiring each year.

The general powers and duties of the Commission include among the most important functions: Approval of all new plats within and for a distance of three miles beyond the limits of the city. Recommendations to the Mayor and Common Council for the opening or widening of all streets and for city plans and improvements generally. Approval of all property to be acquired for park, boulevard and recreation purposes.

Approval of plans and location of all public buildings, monuments, memorials, bridges, or other public structures. Preparation of all park designs and landscape work to be done by the city. Preparation of a building zone plan to regulate the use, height and bulk of buildings, with power and authority to enforce its provisions after approval and adoption by the Common Council. Improvements recommended by the City Plan Commission since March, 1919, and adopted by the Common Council include Street Openings or Widenings, approximately 80 miles, exclusive of plans for an Outer Drive around Detroit, 150 feet wide and 46 miles in length—major portions of which have already been dedicated. Park Areas, 1744 acres in seven (7) parcels. Playgrounds, 18 with a total of 22.23 acres. Playfields, 5 with a total of 158.44 acres. Plats and Land subdivisions, approximately 70. Aviation Field, 320 acres. In addition, the Commission has prepared a comprehensive Zoning ordinance and maps (Edward M. Bassett, Robert H. Whitten, Harland Bartholomew, advisors). Lack of adequate Home Rule power delegated to municipal governing board by State Legislature has prevented the adoption of the Zoning ordinance. A law to enable Michigan cities to zone will be placed before the 1921 session of the State Legislature. The Commission has completed a survey of existing conditions along Detroit's waterfront in connection with the proposed development of the Port of Detroit. Studies have been prepared for the location of a new City Hall in the downtown district. A definite system of main thorofares and boulevards has been prepared by the Commission for a radius of approximately 25 miles about Detroit. This plan has been adopted officially by the Wayne County authorities and public dedication of these thorofares will be required on all future plats and subdivisions. The appropriation from the general city budget to carry on the work of the City Plan Commission amounted to $50,000.00 for 1919-20, and $41,540.00 for 1920-21. There has been an average of fifteen (15) office employees since March 1919. The work of the Commission is carried on in closest co-operation with all other branches and departments of public administration. By recent resolution of the Common Council, the Commission must post notices of public improvements in the neighborhoods affected. Special assessments bear the major cost of local improvements. The Commission and Common Council hold public hearings before adopting any extensive improvements.

Public appreciation and support of plans for civic improvements is evidenced by the $10,000,000 bond issue for parks voted in 1919 and $5,000,000 for bridges 1919 and 1920. Publicity is obtained through public hearings, issuance of pamphlets, public press, lectures and co-operation of local organizations.

REPORTS:

Olmsted, Frederick Law, and **C. M. Robinson.** Improvement of Detroit. Reports to the Detroit Board of Commerce. 1905.

Detroit Board of Commerce. Improvement of Detroit. Proposed extension of Washington Boulevard. Report of Directors to membership, Detroit Board of Commerce. 1906.

Phillips, T. Glenn. City tree planting. Published by Detroit City Plan and Improvement Commission. 1st ed. 1910. Revised ed. 1914.

Detroit City Plan and Improvement Commission. A center of arts and letters. Report of Joint Committee representing various Detroit organizations, together with plans prepared by Edward H. Bennett and Frank Miles Day. 1913.

____James Scott memorial fountain; statement of progress. November, 1914.

Olmsted, Frederick Law. Conditions in Detroit, 1915 (report to the City Plan and Improvement Commission), together with a report to the Detroit Board of Commerce in 1905. Published by the Commission, 1915.

Bennett, Edward H. Preliminary plan of Detroit; together with sketch plans for a new bridge to Belle Isle by Cass Gilbert, architect, Barclay Parsons & Klapp, engineers. Published by Detroit City Plan and Improvement Commission, 1915.

Comey, Arthur Coleman. Detroit suburban planning; report of the City Plan and Improvement Commission. Based on the preliminary plan for Detroit, by E. H. Bennett. Published by the Commission, 1915.

Barclay Parsons & Klapp. Report on Detroit street railway traffic and proposed subway made to Board of Street Railway Commissioners, 1915.

Detroit Department of Public Works. Report on grade separation in Detroit; report of progress, January 1, 1917 to July 1, 1918. Prepared by the Division of Grade Separation and Bridges under the direction of the Department of Public Works.

Detroit City Plan Commission. Excess condemnation. A few facts in support of proposed constitutional amendment approved by Common Council of Detroit. March, 1919.

____Charter provisions for the City Plan Commission, effective March 1, 1919. Published by the Commission. April, 1919.

____Dix-High-Waterloo-thoroughfare; the opening, widening and connecting of an important crosstown traffic route for Detroit. 1919.

____A building zone plan for Detroit. November, 1919.

____Michigan excess condemnation act. An amendment to the constitution of the State of Michigan as adopted by the Legislature in extra session 1919, to be submitted to the vote of the people, November, 1920. Published by the City Plan Commission. November, 1919.

DOVER, NEW JERSEY

DIGEST OF ANSWER:
Comprehensive city plan was prepared in 1914, but no improvements have been carried out.

REPORTS:

Comey, Arthur Coleman. Town planning for Dover. Report to the Mayor and Common Council. 1913.

DUBUQUE, IOWA

No answer received.

REPORTS:

Robinson, Charles Mulford. Report on the improvement of Dubuque, to a Joint Committee representing Dubuque Commercial Club, Civic Division Dubuque Woman's Club, and Trades and Labor Congress. 1907.

EAST SAINT LOUIS, ILLINOIS

DIGEST OF ANSWER:
Comprehensive city plan prepared by Harland Bartholomew for War Civics Committee, not yet carried out. Rebuilding some streets and improving parks and high costs delay improvement on a large scale. Municipal authority is Mayor and four Commissioners. Plan prepared prior to appointment of authority to carry it into execution. Some of public oppose it on account of costs, others appreciate value of such plans.

REPORTS:

Bartholomew, Harland. A comprehensive city plan for East St. Louis, prepared for War Civics Committee. East St. Louis, 1920.

ELGIN, ILLINOIS

DIGEST OF ANSWER:
City has a comprehensive plan prepared for Elgin Commercial Club by E. H. Bennett. Improvements have been carried out according to plan: street openings and parks and playgrounds. Work done under Commission form of city government. Plan prepared prior to appointment of authority to carry it out. Difficulties found in lack of funds owing to restriction to certain per cent. of valuation. Public appreciative. General educational campaigns necessary since all appropriations voted by people under commission form of government.

REPORTS:

Bennett, Edward H. Plan of Elgin, prepared for Elgin Commercial Club. January, 1917.

ERIE, PENNSYLVANIA

DIGEST OF ANSWER:
Comprehensive city plan prepared 1913 by John Nolen. Improvements have been carried out: city has laid out 3-mile zone outside city limits; state law requires City Planning approval before plat or deed can be recorded. Municipal authority is City Planning Commission named by City Council (subsequent to Nolen plan). Great difficulties encountered in old section of city, new streets, compelled to be in line with city streets and some dispute as to city jurisdiction outside city

limits. Public does appreciate value of plans. "Too bad not in effect 25 years ago." Mass meetings were held when annexation territory was up, and maps presented showing great benefit by following plan.

REPORTS:

Erie City Planning Committee. Greater Erie; plans and reports for the extension and improvement of the city, prepared for the City Planning Committee of the Chamber of Commerce and The Board of Trade. John Nolen, city planner. Supplementary chapters by E. P. Goodrich, Henry C. Long, and F. van Z. Lane. 1913.

EVANSTON, ILLINOIS

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

Comprehensive city plan prepared by Small Parks and Playgrounds Association in 1918. No improvements carried out according to it, owing to high costs and curtailment of all but very necessary work. Common Council Action the municipal authority. Public appreciates value of plans very much, and the Association and clubs create interest. "We are now working on a Zoning Ordinance (prepared by Harland Bartholomew). Our City Plan is very beautiful and necessarily very costly; and it will be a long time before we can hope to start on it. We believe zoning to be more vital to the general health and welfare than 'city planning,' so called." —H. P. Pearsons, Mayor.

REPORTS:

Evanston Small Parks and Playgrounds Assocation. Plan of Evanston. (Edited by Henry K. Webster.) 1917. (D. H. Burnham, Jr., Chairman Plan Committee of Architects.)

FALL RIVER, MASSACHUSETTS

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

"A planning Board was appointed by me some time ago under authority of an act of the Legislature. This Board has engaged an engineer who is preparing plans for the development of the center of the city, and the Board will later on consider a plan for the whole city."—Mayor J. H. Kay.

REPORTS:

Fall River Watuppa Ponds and Quequechan River Commission. Report, together with report of Fay, Spofford and Thorndike, consulting engineers. Boston, 1915.

FAYETTEVILLE, NEW YORK

DIGEST OF ANSWER:
No comprehensive plan. Village Board of Trustees is municipal authority. Public unappreciative of plans. There is Civic League for creating interest. Effort is being made to secure improved thoroughfare through village which will require bonds to the limit.

REPORTS:

Robinson, Charles Mulford. Fayetteville's opportunities. Report to the Fayetteville Park Commission. 1909.

FITCHBURG, MASSACHUSETTS

DIGEST OF ANSWER:
No comprehensive city plan and none contemplated. City Council action the authority for improvements. People are not ready to favor a general plan. There is a Municipal Development Commission which hopes to create interest in general city improvements by "patient agitation."

REPORTS:

Comey, Arthur Coleman. Preliminary study of the thorofare system of Fitchburg, 1915. (Municipal Development Commission, Bul. no. 4)

FLINT, MICHIGAN

DIGEST OF ANSWER:
There is a comprehensive plan. Survey was begun in 1917, and report published 1920 with recommendations of Mr. Nolen on city planning and Mr. Arnold on transportation. (Also Mr. Manning reported to Park Commission in 1918.) Several hundred acres of park land were purchased to carry out the plan, and several main thoroughfares and parkways have been opened by condemnation. The City Planning Board was organized in June 1917, about the time consultants were engaged. It was established by city charter amendment and has power to plan for 3 miles beyond the city limits. All recommendations of the Board must be passed by Council if expenditure involved. Difficulties encountered in lack of city ordinance regulating platting, now being drafted, and lack of authority for zoning and excess condemnation. Public appreciative. Publicity secured in local paper and lantern lec-

tures to fraternal and labor organizations. "Endless education is necessary."

REPORTS:

Nolen, John, and **Bion J. Arnold.** The city plan of Flint, Mich., as approved by the City Planning Board and accepted by the Common Council. Published by the City Planning Board, 1920.

FORT WAYNE, INDIANA

No answer received. (George E. Kessler & Co. issued a map of Fort Wayne in 1920, showing present parks, proposed parks and boulevards and park districts.)

REPORTS:

Robinson, Charles Mulford. Report for Fort Wayne Civic Improvement Association. 1910.

GLEN RIDGE, NEW JERSEY

No answer received. (Town center improvements carried out according to plan.)

REPORTS:

Nolen, John. Glen Ridge, a report. 1909. (Plans prepared for Muncipal Art Commission, and published by committee of citizens.)

GRAND CANYON, ARIZONA

No questionnaire sent.

REPORTS:

Waugh, Frank A. A plan for the development of the Village of Grand Canyon. 1918. (U. S. Dept. of Agriculture Forest Service.)

GRAND RAPIDS, MICHIGAN

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

Preliminary plan of 1907 (Carrère & Brunner) being used as basis. Some improvements have been carried out: 5 parks and a 5½ mile drive acquired. City Planning Commission appointed by City Commission, Summer 1919, to act in advisory capacity is studying situation, and waiting for excess condemnation amendment to State Constitution (to come up

November 1920) before recommending any large plans. Cooperative spirit on part of City Commission, but nothing laid before public as yet.

REPORTS:

Brunner, Arnold W. and John M. Carrère. Preliminary report for a city plan for Grand Rapids. Submitted to the City Plan Commission. 1909.

GREENVILLE, SOUTH CAROLINA

No answer received.

REPORTS:

Kelsey & Guild. Beautifying and improving Greenville. Report to the Municipal League. Boston, January, 1907.

HARRISBURG, PENNSYLVANIA

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

Answer received late. (Important river front and park improvements, following recommendations by Warren H. Manning, have been carried out. Monumental development of the capitol grounds is projected, Arnold W. Brunner and Warren H. Manning, consultants.) There is a City Planning Commission confirmed by Council. Comprehensive city plan has been prepared, controlling a radius of three miles outside city limits.

REPORTS:

McFarland, J. Horace. The awakening of Harrisburg: some account of the improvement movement begun in 1902; with the progress of the work to the end of 1906. Published in cooperation with the Municipal League of Harrisburg and the Harrisburg Board of Trade, by the National Municipal League.

HARTFORD, CONNECTICUT

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

Has comprehensive plan, by Carrère and Hastings, 1911, in accordance with which improvements have been carried out: new streets in both residence and business districts, street widenings, waterfront improvements, development of vacant and unimproved tracts of land. A Commission on The City Plan was established by Charter amendment in 1907*. Chief

difficulties encountered, in relation to excess condemnation and appropriations for radical and expensive changes. Apathy on part of political powers and lack of cooperation on part of business interests. Public appreciates plans only to limited extent. Interest created largely through public press.
*First in United States.

REPORTS:

Carrère & Hastings. A plan of Hartford. Preliminary report to the Hartford Commission on the City Plan. 1912.

HONOLULU, HAWAII

No answer received.

REPORTS:

Robinson, Charles Mulford. The beautifying of Honolulu. Report for the Board of Supervisors. 1906. Reprinted, 1907.

HOUSTON, TEXAS

No answer received.

REPORTS:

Comey, Arthur Coleman. Houston; tentative plans for its development; report to the Houston Park Commission. Boston, 1913.

INDIANAPOLIS, INDIANA

No answer received.

REPORTS:

Brown, Charles Carroll. A group plan for Indianapolis. Indianapolis Civic Improvement Association. Bul. no. 1 (about 1905)

ITHACA, NEW YORK

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

No comprehensive plan, but preparation of one anticipated by appointment of a Commission to advise the City Administration. Pavements are being extended and the city expects to establish a recreation park at the Lake. Municipal authority is Common Council and Board of Public Works. Public to be interested through press, Rotary Club, and other local organizations. Public appreciation of plans expected.

REPORTS:

Manning, Warren H. Report to accompany study for a system of reservations for Ithaca. 1908.

JAMESTOWN, NEW YORK

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

A plan was prepared in 1908 by Charles Mulford Robinson. Municipal authority is combination of common council with appointive commissions for public utilities and welfare. Public has not manifested any appreciation of value of plans.

REPORTS:

Jamestown Board of Park Commissioners. First annual report, embracing a comprehensive plan for the establishment of a city park system, by Charles Mulford Robinson. 1908.

JERSEY CITY, NEW JERSEY

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

No comprehensive city plan.

REPORTS:

Goodrich, Ernest P. and **George B. Ford.** Report of suggested plan of procedure for City Plan Commission, Jersey City. As of November 30, 1912. Issue May 1, 1913.

____Addenda memoranda. 1913.

Lane, F. Van Z. $50,000,000 more ratables for Jersey City. Preliminary report to Jersey City Chamber of Commerce on an industrial development railroad for Jersey City, January, 1915.

JOHNSTOWN, PENNSYLVANIA

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

City plan prepared by experts employed by the City Planning Commission in 1917. No improvements to amount to anything carried out owing to war. City Planning Commission operates under 1913 state law. No special difficulties, except increased cost has somewhat stood in the way of progress. Public believed to be appreciative but have not had opportunity to study the plan because only 500 copies of report were printed. Interest created by illustrated lectures,

newspaper stories, and recently through the public school system. Work with the schools expected to prove of great interest.

REPORTS:

Hornbostel, Henry, George Wild, and Victor A. Rigaumont. The comprehensive plan of Johnstown, a city practicable. Report to City Planning Commission and the City Council. 1917.

KANSAS CITY, MISSOURI

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

Ordinance providing for appointment and establishment of a City Planning Commission passed and approved by Mayor December 16, 1919. "The Mayor has appointed a commission of eight members, the commission has organized opened executive offices and is beginning work on a city plan."—Secretary, City Plan Commission, August 23, 1920.

REPORTS:

Kansas City Board of Park Commissioners. Special report for the Blue Valley Parkway. 1912.

Arnold, Bion J. Report on the value of the properties of the Metropolitan Street Railway system of Kansas City. A study of the complete traction problem of the city. Report to Circuit Judge. 1913.

LA CROSSE, WISCONSIN

No answer received. (Comprehensive plan prepared by John Nolen, 1920, for War Memorial Committee of La Cross, representing Chamber of Commerce, City Government, Park Board, and County Commissioners.)

REPORTS:

Nolen, John. The making of a park system in La Crosse. Report to Park Commission. 1911.

LAWRENCE, MASSACHUSETTS

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

"No city plan has ever been taken of the city of Lawrence, and there is none in contemplation."

REPORTS:

Lawrence Planning Board. Annual reports. (2d, 1915, contains Lawrence city planning studies, report by A. C. Comey.)

LITTLE ROCK, ARKANSAS

No answer received. (Some improvements, especially in-town parks, carried out.)

REPORTS:

Nolen, John. Report on a park system for Little Rock, (to the Little Rock Parkways Association). 1913.

LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

No comprehensive plan officially, but various plans suggested. City now considering preparation of one by establishing official city planning commission. Public appreciates somewhat the value of plans. Interest being created by semi-monthly educational programs of City Planning Association and publicity in newspapers. (Ordinance creating City Planning Board passed March, 1920.)

REPORTS:

Los Angeles Municipal Art Commission. Report containing The city beautiful; suggestions by Charles Mulford Robinson. 1909.

Arnold, Bion J. The transportation problem of Los Angeles. Report published as special supplement to "The California Outlook," November, 1911.

Cox, Laurie Davidson. Report on proposed Arroyo Seco Parkway submitted to the Los Angeles Board of Park Commissioners. Published as special supplement to "The California Outlook," November 18, 1911.

MADISON, NEW JERSEY

No answer received.

REPORTS:

Manning, Warren H. Improvement of Madison. Report to the Highway, Park and Playground Committee of the Madison Civic Association. 1909.

MADISON, WISCONSIN

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

No comprehensive plan and none anticipated.

REPORTS:

Nolen, John. Madison: a model city. Report to the Madison Park and Pleasure Drive Association and Citizens' Committee. Boston, 1911.

MANILA, PHILIPPINE ISLANDS

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

Comprehensive city plan, prepared by the late D. H. Burnham, 1905, and called Burnham plan of Manila.

"Besides the Burnham plan, the zonification of the City is contemplated dividing it into residential, commercial, semi-industrial and industrial districts. A limited area around the mansion of His Excellency, the Governor-General, has already been set aside by ordinance as a residence section. Extensive improvements have already been made. The acquisition of lands is about completed for the Harrison Park, which has an area of nearly 50 hectares. In the layout and openings of streets about 1-5 completed. The public buildings are all located according to the plan. Recently, the widening of Rizal Avenue, in the center and commercial district of the City, was accomplished at a cost of nearly a quarter of a million dollars. By a special charter, the government of the city is vested in a Mayor and a Municipal Board." "It is also provided in the Administrative Code that the Consulting Architect is charged with the interpretation of the Burnham plan for the improvement of the City of Manila." No difficulties of outside source have been encountered in proceeding with prepared plans; the only one is the limited fund available. "There is, however, great opposition to the proposed zonification, partly on account of what is termed 'vested interests' and 'acquired interests,' and partly from owners of improved real estate who claim that the zonification, limiting and fixing the kind of use of land, will lower the value of their respective lots. The public appreciates the value of such plans, although practically nothing is done in the direction of creating public interest. However, the people are informed by means of the press of all proposed important improvements, and public discussions are often held prior to carrying out proposed improvements"—Justo Lubkan, Mayor.

REPORTS:

Burnham, Daniel Hudson. Report on proposed improvements at Manila. 1905. From the Report of the Phlippine Commission. Part I. (Bureau of Insular Affairs, War Department, Washington, 1906.)

MILWAUKEE, WISCONSIN

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

Comprehensive city plan in preparation by Board of Public Land Commissioners. About 15 miles of streets are now being widened; park additions and civic center now under consideration; zoning ordinance in progress. Board of Public Land Commissioners originally organized to carry out excess condemnation now functions as city plan commission. All plans thus far in course of realization required a great deal of publicity, but public interest increasing to marked degree.

REPORTS:

Milwaukee City Planning Commission. Preliminary reports of the City Planning Commission to the City. 1911. (Includes reports of F. L. Olmsted and John Nolen.)

Hegemann, Werner. City planning for Milwaukee; what it means and why it must be secured. Report to Wisconsin Chapter of the American Institute of Architects, the City Club, the Milwaukee Real Estate Association, Westminster League, South Side Civic Association. February, 1916.

Milwaukee Board of Public Land Commissioners. Grouping of public buildings. A report to the Milwaukee Common Council. April, 1919.

____Zoning for Milwaukee. Tentative report of the Commissioners, June, 1920. (Arthur C. Comey, consultant.)

MINNEAPOLIS, MINNESOTA

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

City plan prepared in 1915 through efforts of Minneaoplis Civic Commission, an unofficial body. Several improvements are being carried out by city government: Washington Square Park, erection of Art Museum, important street openings and widenings, Third Avenue Bridge, etc., representing outlay of over $5,000,000; other improvements under consideration.

City Planning Commission advisory to City Council recently established in conformity with State enabling act. Chief difficulties have been prejudices of property owners. Zoning difficulties [lessened by recent reversal of Minnesota Supreme Court decision.] Public appreciative. Interest created by practical demonstrations.

REPORTS:

Minneapolis Civic Commission. Preliminary plan of Minneapolis—Notes (on report of E. H. Bennett.) 1911.

Minneapolis Civic and Commerce Association. Report of Municipal Committee on Limitation of Height of Buildings. 1914.

Minneapolis Civic Commission. Plan of Minneapolis, prepared under the direction of the Commission, by Edward H. Bennett. Edited and written by Andrew Wright Crawford. 1917.

MONTCLAIR, NEW JERSEY

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

No comprehensive plan. Nolen plan for future development prepared some years ago at expense of certain private individuals "has never been adopted by controlling powers" though some features have been incorporated in subsequent buildings, in a certain measure. Local community organizations create strong public interest in improvements.

REPORTS:

Nolen, John. Montclair, the preservation of its natural beauty and its improvement as a residence town. Report to the Municipal Art Commission and the Commission's recommendations to the citizens. 1909.

NEW HAVEN, CONNECTICUT

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

City plan prepared by Frederick Law Olmsted some years ago, but improvements have not been carried out to any extent. No proper machinery for getting them executed and public knows little about them. Present municipal authority is Board of Aldermen.

REPORTS:

New Haven Civic Improvement Committee. Report of the New Haven Civic Improvement Commission to the Committee. Cass Gilbert, architect. Frederick Law Olmsted, landscape architect. 1910.

Ford Frederick L. Report on railroad station approach and harbor front improvements, made to the Mayor and Aldermanic Approach Committee. 1912.

NEW LONDON, CONNECTICUT

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

Comprehensive city plan was prepared by Park Board and City Engineer. All plans for future development of land are subject to approval of Park Board. Improvements have been carried out according to plan, and new lay-outs are passed on by City Council after approval of Park Board (restrictions as to buildings, etc.) Public appreciates plans, and interest has been created by meetings of Chamber of Commerce and Press.

REPORTS:

Nolen, John. General plan of a park and playground system for New London. Report to Municipal Art Society. Boston, 1913.

NEW YORK CITY

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

"We have a comprehensive city plan: that is, a plan covering practically all of the five boroughs except the Borough of Richmond. Some of these maps are still what are called 'tentative,' that is, they do not give precise block dimensions and angles and the streets have not been monumented. The Borough of Richmond is largely a rural district and there is a good deal of mapping to be done there. These plans are not perhaps what are frequently called comprehensive plans in that, although they show many cases of important streets to be created in the future, they do not include as comprehensive a system as might be desirable of main traffic thoroughfares, parks and parkways. The plan of the City has been of slow growth. The first extensive plan for undeveloped territory was that for Manhattan Island as far north as 155th Street made by the Commission authorized in 1807. The

President of each borough is now charged with the making of the plans of unmapped territory and for all modifications in existing plans. These plans are submitted to the Board of Estimate and Apportionment and are critically reviewed in this office and none of them is effective until adopted by the Board of Estimate and Apportionment after a public hearing. Improvements can be carried out only in accordance with established plans. Streets or parks can be acquired only after they have been laid out in the manner described. The City acts through the Board of Estimate and Apportionment. It has no City Plan Commission and the Common Council or Board of Aldermen have no jurisdiction. There is a Committee on City Plan in the Board of Estimate and Apportionment but that Committee simply considers plans submitted to the Board by the Borough Presidents and reports of this office are made to that Committee. As the Committee consists of a majority of the Board its recommendations are usually conclusive. The difficulties in proceeding with prepared plans are chiefly lack of control over private developments which may disregard the established plan. This trouble has been largely overcome through the enactment of two laws. One of these requires every owner of real estate, before selling lots, to file his plans in the office of record where real estate conveyances are filed. The other law forbids the recording officers above referred to to accept for filing plans for property subdivision until they shall first have been approved by the Board of Estimate and Apportionment. This gives an opportunity to see that the plans for subdivisions correspond with the adopted city plan or are consistent with proposed plans where not yet officially adopted. There is still no way to prevent the owner of property from erecting buildings within street lines before the city has acquired-title to the Streets. In most of these cases, however, the builders require loans and the title companies are very cautious about giving the necessary title policies where proposed buildings are in conflict with established street lines. The public undoubtedly appreciates the value of a comprehensive plan and strict conformity with that plan. (The adoption by the City of New York of the Zoning Resolution in 1916 has met with a very general popular approval and there is no one thing which has done more to promote an orderly city development.)"—N. P. Lewis, Chief Engineer.

REPORTS:

New York City Improvement Commission. Report to the Mayor and Board of Aldermen. 1904. Another edition of same, 1905.

____Report. 1907.

Wilgus, William J. Proposed new railway system for the transportation and distribution of freight by improved methods in the city and port of New York. Submitted to the Public Service Commission for the First District by the Amsterdam Corporation. 1908.

New York Department of Docks and Ferries. (Special reports.) 1909.

New York Commission on Congestion of Population. Report to the Mayor and Board of Aldermen. 1911.

New York Board of Estimate and Apportionment. Report of a committee of the Board, and of the Public Service Commission for the First District, with relation to pending proposals for the construction, equipment and operation of rapid transit lines, and upon the general transit situation in New York City. 1911.

New York Fifth Avenue Commission. Preliminary report. 1910. (Arnold W. Brunner, Chairman.)

New York (State) Bronx Parkway Commission. Report to the Board of Estimate and Apportionment. 1912. (Reports of Commission for 1916 and 1918 review Parkway improvement.)

New York Heights of Buildings Commission. Report to the Committee on height, size and arrangement of buildings of the Board of Estimate and Apportionment. 1913. (Edward M. Bassett, Chairman, Advisory Committee, George B. Ford, Secretary.)

Brunner, Arnold W., and Frederick Law Olmsted. Proposed change of map for Riverside Drive extension. Submitted to the President of the Borough of Manhattan. 1913.

New York City Comptroller. Downtown Brooklyn. A report to the Comptroller on sites for public buildings and the relocation of the elevated tracks now in lower Fulton Street, Borough of Brooklyn. 1913.

Brooklyn Committee on City Plan. Brooklyn City Plan (by E. H. Bennett.) Published as special supplement to Brooklyn Eagle, January 18, 1914.

New Jersey Harbor Commission. New Jersey's relation to the Port of New York. 4th preliminary report of the New Jersey Harbor Commission. 1914

New York Board of Estimate and Apportionment. Committee on the City Plan. Development and present status of city planning in New York City, a report; together with papers presented at a meeting of the Advisory Commission on City Plan. 1914.

New York Board of Estimate and Apportionment. Committee on Markets. Reports on market system for New York City and on open markets established in Manhattan. 1915.

Cox, Laurie Davidson. A street tree system for New York City, Borough of Manhattan. March, 1916. (Bulletin of New York State College of Forestry at Syracuse University. Vol. 16, no. 8.)

New York Commission on Building Districts and Restrictions. Tentative report. March 10, 1916.

New York Board of Estimate and Apportionment. Building-zone plan. Report of Committee of the Whole. July 18, 1916.

New York Commission on Building Districts and Restrictions. Final (comprehensive) report, New York Board of Estimate and Apportionment, Committee on the City Plan. (As of) June 2, 1916. Published 1917.

New York Central Railroad Company. West side improvement plans—track and park treatment sheets approved by the Board of Estimate and Apportionment of the City of New York. 1916.

New York Board of Estimate and Apportionment. Annual report of the Chief Engineer for 1917. (Special section on benefit assessments.)

Whitten, Robert H. Erection of buildings within line of proposed streets laid down on final map of city of New

York. New York, Board of Estimate and Apportionment, Committee on City Plan. December, 1917.

New York, New Jersey Port and Harbor Development Commission. Preliminary joint report; transmitted to the legislature. Albany, February, 1918.

NEWARK, NEW JERSEY

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

Comprehensive plan prepared in 1915 by City Plan Commission's staff. Front Street has been straightened, but no other recommendations yet carried out. City Plan Commission appointed by the Mayor was abolished in Fall of 1917.

REPORTS:

Newark Board of Trade. City Planning. Report of Committee on Civic Art and Architecture. 1911.

Newark City Plan Commission. Preliminary report to the Commission by Messrs. Ford and Goodrich. 1912.

Ford, George B. and E. P. Goodrich. Newark market problem. Report to Newark City Plan Commission. 1912.

Goodrich, E. P. Recommendations of Irving T. Bush, accompanied by Report of E. P. Goodrich, consulting engineer, to Board of Street and Water Commissioners on the development of public docks and shipping facilities and the utilization of meadow lands in connection therewith. 1912.

Puff, Charles Frederick, Jr. The City Plan of Newark. Report on the comprehensive planning of the metropolitan district of greater Newark, submitted to the Department of Public Works. 1912.

Newark City Plan Commission. City planning for Newark. 1913. (E. P. Goodrich and George B. Ford.)

Ford, James. Housing report to the City Plan Commission of Newark. Report made for E. P. Goodrich and George B. Ford by Dr. James Ford. 1913.

Conference on Interurban Improvement of Newark and Adjacent Municipalities. Property development; report of the Real Estate Committee. Published by the City Plan Commission, 1914.

____Report of the Committee on Streets and Highways. Published by the City Plan Commission. 1915.

Newark City Plan Commission. A public recreation system for Newark. Suggestions and recommendations. 1915.

____Comprehensive plan of Newark. 1915. (Harland Bartholomew, Secretary).

Olmsted Brothers. Report on a proposed parkway system for Essex County, New Jersey. Brookline, Mass., June, 1915.

Newark Commission on Building Districts and Restrictions. Proposed building zones for Newark: tentative report of the Commission. September, 1919. (Herbert S. Swan, consultant.)

NEWPORT, RHODE ISLAND

No answer received. (Portion of Bath Road improvement carried out.)

REPORTS:

Olmsted, Frederick Law. Proposed improvements for Newport; a report prepared for the Newport Improvement Association. Cambridge, Mass., the University Press. 1913.

NEWTON, MASSACHUSETTS

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

A comprehensive plan in course of publication, A. A. Shurtleff and John W. Fox assisting the Planning Board, with cooperation from the City Engineer and other departments. No improvements yet carried out. Difficulties met in "ignorance until shown, delay in getting appropriations until convinced of practical and economic value." Public not appreciative, but popular interest being created by hearings, public meetings of Improvement Societies, and group meetings in different centers with the Planning Board.

REPORTS:

Newton Planning Board. Annual reports. (1914-1917 contain plans for street openings, widenings, and revisions.)

NIAGARA FALLS, NEW YORK

DIGEST OF ANSWER:
A comprehensive city plan was prepared by John Nolen in 1919, but no improvements have been carried out according to plan, since the only movement taken in regard to it was turned down by the tax-payers. It is the intention to carry it out further in the near future, "but owing to the high cost of materials, etc., it is impossible to create any great interest at the present time." Municipal authority is City Manager.

REPORTS:

Olmsted Brothers. Parks and playgrounds for Niagara Falls, report to Chairman of Niagara Falls Parks Board. 1917. (Published in multigraphed form 1919.)

Nolen, John. Zoning problem of the City of Niagara Falls. An outline of regulations. Issued by Zoning Committee. December, 1918. Revised ed. May, 1919.

NORFOLK, VIRGINIA

DIGEST OF ANSWER:
City plan in preparation by City Planning Commissioners recently created. Hearty cooperation so far in work on plans. Popular interest created through an Advisory Board of 25 citizens.

REPORTS:

Norfolk Commission on Beautifying the City. Second report to Mayor, Board of Control, Board of Aldermen and Common Council. 1913.

OAKLAND, CALIFORNIA

No answer received.

REPORTS:

Robinson, Charles Mulford. A plan of civic improvement for Oakland. 1906. (To the Mayor and City Council.)

Hegemann, Werner. Report on a city plan for the municipalities of Oakland and Berkeley. Prepared and published under the auspices of the municipal governments of Oakland and Berkeley, the Supervisors of Alameda County, the Chamber of Commerce and Commercal Club of Oak-

land, the Civic Art Commission of Berkeley, the City Club of Berkeley. 1915.

OGDENSBURG, NEW YORK

DIGEST OF ANSWER:
No comprehensive city plan, but report on improvements by C. M. Robinson in 1907. No action has ever been taken to carry out the suggestions.

REPORTS:

Robinson, Charles Mulford. Report on the improvement of the city of Ogdensburg (to the Mayor and Common Council). 1907.

OKLAHOMA CITY, OKLAHOMA

No answer received. (City Plan Commission has been appointed, represented by several delegates at meeting of National Conference on City Planning at Cincinnati, April, 1920. Public interest being aroused.)

REPORTS:

Dunn, W. H. Oklahoma City: a report on its plan for an outer parkway and a plan for an interior system of parks and boulevards (to the Board of Park Commissioners). Kansas City Mo. 1910.

OMAHA, NEBRASKA

DIGEST OF ANSWER:
A "somewhat" comprehensive plan and zoning system prepared by City Planning Board. Board is advisory to City Council. Improvements have been carried out according to plan, but difficulties encountered in lack of funds. Public in part appreciative. Public meetings are held and interest created through newspapers, and constant effort.

REPORTS:

Omaha City Plan Commission. Preliminary studies for a city plan. November, 1917. (Messrs. Ford, Goodrich, and Robinson, advisory.)

____City planning needs of Omaha: Street widening and extensions, inner belt traffic way, river drive. 1919. (Harland Bartholomew, consultant.)

PARIS, TEXAS

No answer received.

REPORTS:

Dunn, W. H. General city plan for Paris. Submitted to the public with the official approval of the City Council, the Board of Trade, and the Progressive Club. 1915.

PASADENA, CALIFORNIA

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

Much attention has been given to preparation of a plan by a committee of citizens and experts supported largely by the City. Zoning plan is to be prepared. Improvements have been carried out according to plan,—parks, and street openings and widenings. The semi-official Planning Committee has gone out of existence. Chief difficulties arose in voting of bond issues. A fairly general appreciation of value of plans, created by existing civic organizations and special campaigns.

REPORTS:

Damon, George A. Some preliminary suggestions for a "Pasadena Plan." Pasadena, Woman's Civic League. 1915.

Pasadena Civic Federation. Progress report of the City Planning Committee. 1917.

PEORIA, ILLINOIS

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

Comprehensive plan to be prepared by employment of city planning engineer and appointment of Commission on City Planning. Difficulties lie in means to finance plans, but public appreciates value. Interest aroused through civic bodies.

REPORTS:

Peoria Association of Commerce. City Planning Number of "The Peorian." July, 1914.

PHILADELPHIA, PENNSYLVANIA

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

Unofficial comprehensive plan prepared by Bureau of Surveys 1911 and previous. Streets, parks, bridges, railroad agreements, etc. carried out according to it. The Board of Surveyors has power to plot streets after authorization by Coun-

cil. No serious difficulties encountered and public very appreciative. Various civic bodies create interest, and city officials give lectures.

REPORTS:

City Parks Association of Philadelphia. Special report on the city plan. 1902.

Philadelphia Parkway Association. The proposed parkway for Philadelphia, edited by Albert Kelsey. 1902.

Philadelphia Mayor's Comprehensive Plans Committees. Reports, in Comprehensive Plans Number of "Philadelphia," March, 1911.

Philadelphia Department of Public Works. South Philadelphia. The abolishment of grade crossings and the creation of opportunities for commercial and industrial development. 1913.

Philadelphia Transit Commissioner. Report. 1913.

Philadelphia Permanent Committee on Comprehensive Plans. Report on the proposition of a central traffic circuit. Philadelphia. Department of Public Works. 1915.

Philadelphia Department of City Transit. (A. Merritt Taylor, Director). Special report on rapid-transit development for Philadelphia, to the Select and Common Councils. 1915.

____A study and review of the problem of passenger transportation in Philadelphia by a unified system of lines. An analysis of the plans proposed for its solution with suggested methods for their improvement, By William S. Twining, Director. Submitted to the Select and Common Councils. 1916.

Philadelphia Permanent Committee on Comprehensive Plans. Report on the revision and extension of the street system in Southwest Philadelphia. Department of Public Works. 1917.

Fairmount Park Art Association. The Fairmount Parkway; a pictorial record of development, 1904-1919.

City Parks Association of Philadelphia. Annual reports. 1903-date. (Especially useful for record of progress on plans.)

Philadelphia Department of Public Works. Bureau of Surveys. Annual reports. (1915 of special interest.)

PITTSBURGH, PENNSYLVANIA

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

No answer received. (Progress on improvements in accordance with plans was reported at National Conference on City Planning, Cincinnati, April, 1920. "Hump" cut in downtown district one of the most notable. Zoning plan in preparation, Harland Bartholomew, consultant. Publicity campaign recently launched by Citizens' Committee on City Plan.)

REPORTS:

Architectural League of America. (Sixth annual convention.) A Plan for the architectural improvement of Pittsburgh. 1904.

American Institute of Architects. Pittsburgh chapter. Proposed improvements for Pittsburgh. Prepared 1907. (Published later.)

Arnold, Bion J., John R. Freeman, and **Frederick Law Olmsted.** City planning for Pittsburgh, outline and procedure, a report. Pittsburgh Civic Commission, December, 1909. Published 1910.

Arnold, Bion J. Report on the Pittsburgh transportation problem, submitted to the Mayor. 1910.

Symons, Thomas W., and **Frederick Law Olmsted.** The city and the Allegheny River bridges. Report to Pittsburgh Civic Commission. 1910.

Olmsted, Frederick Law. Pittsburgh main thoroughfares and the down town district. Report prepared under the direction of the Committee on City Planning, Pittsburgh Civic Commission. 1911. (Includes the Bridges report above.)

Pittsburgh Department of City Planning. Annual report. 1913. (First.)

Pittsburgh Art Commission. An account of the work of the Art Commission from its creation in 1911 to January 1, 1915. Published 1915.

Civic Club of Allegheny County. Municipal Planning Committee. Report on city properties. July 1, 1917.

____Districting and zoning; what it is; why Pittsburgh should do it. January 1, 1918.

Citizens' Committee on City Plan of Pittsburgh. Pittsburgh playgrounds study and recommendations. June, 1920. Report No. 1.

____Pittsburgh playgrounds. Report No. 1-A. June, 1920. (A popularization of Report No. 1.)

PORTLAND, OREGON

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

A comprehensive plan was prepared in 1912 by E. H. Bennett, for which money was provided by private contributions and the work done under the auspices of the Greater Portland Plans Association. A few of the recommendations of this plan as to parks and streets have been carried out, but they are relatively unimportant. There is now a City Planning Commission authorized by ordinance and appointed by the Mayor, January 1919. The Commission has been engaged principally upon a comprehensive zoning plan for the city. (C. H. Cheney, consultant.) It has attempted to secure approval of the zoning ordinance by newspaper publicity, by bulletins, and by neighborhood meetings and conferences with various organizations. The chief difficulties encountered have been the results of lack of information or misunderstanding on the part of property owners. The general public and many public officials have never properly appreciated the Bennett plans.

REPORTS:

Olmsted Brothers. Report outlining a system of parkways, boulevards, and parks for Portland. Published in the Report of the Park Board for 1903.

Bennett, Edward H. The Greater Portland plan, edited by Marshall N. Dana. 1912. (Submitted to the Mayor by City Plan Committee.)

Portland City Planning Commission. Zoning and city planning for Portand. Commission Bul. no. 1, June, 1919.

----Proposed building zones for Portland, as tentatively recommended by the neighborhood property owners' meetings and the City Planning Commission. Commission Bul. no. 4, November, 1919.

----Regulations adopted by the Portland City Planning Commission relating to laying out, dedication and acceptance of streets, and to the approval of sub-division and street plans, within or for six miles outside the city limits. 1919.

PROVIDENCE, RHODE ISLAND

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

No comprehensive plan as yet, only fragments to be combined later. Ordinance which created City Plan Commission several years ago directed it to prepare full and comprehensive Plan. Commission is advisory body. Although improvements have not been carried out according to a single comprehensive plan, all waterworks and sewers for many years have followed generous plans prepared for whole city and some outlying territory, and Metropolitan Park acquirements and distribution of playgrounds have been strictly in accordance with original plan. Street improvements thus far have been mostly individually considered. Difficulties encountered in selfishness and lack of understanding on part of individual property owners as to utility of concerted action. Happy exception in recent plans and development of harbor. Creation of civic center and City Hall Park "followed years of rival plans and bitter arguments, but we have it nevertheless." Public not adequately appreciative. Public education carried on by various associations, lectures, publications, conventions of national organizations in the city, newspaper notices, Chamber of Commerce, and advertising methods.

REPORTS:

Providence Metropolitan Park Commissioners. Report upon a system of public reservations for the Metropolitan District of Providence Plantations. First and second report of commissioners, 1905-1906.

Arnold, Bion J. Report on the traction improvements and development within the Providence District to the Joint Committee on Railroad Franchises, Providence City Council. 1911.

Providence Commission on East Side Approach. Reports, including the reports of Engineer John R. Freeman. 1912.

Joint Special Committee on Subways Report and Report of Engineer William W. Lewis, together with Resolution and Draft Act to provide Rapid transit in Providence. 1914.

Providence City Plan Commission. First annual report. 1915.

PUEBLO, COLORADO

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

Comprehensive plan prepared in 1916 by Irvin J. McCrary, landscape architect. No definite movement has been started as yet to carry out the recommendations, main difficulty in proceeding being the heavy municipal debt, incurred under old aldermanic system. City now has new Commission Government Plan. Only small proportion of city appreciates value of plans. Interest created by committees, by newspaper publicity, and by Commerce, Rotary, and Lions' Clubs.

REPORTS:

McCrary, Irvin J. Pueblo improvement plan; a report to the Commissioners of Pueblo. January, 1916.

QUINCY, MASSACHUSETTS

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

A comprehensive plan by prominent expert under consideration to be paid for by subscription. Suggestions made by the City Planning Board are generally followed in carrying out city improvements. Board acts under state law and Common Council Ordinance of 1915. "Difficulties are in the future." Interest being created by hearings before City Council.

REPORTS:

Quincy Planning Board. Annual reports. (1915-1916 contain plans for Pilgrim Highway, and street, park, and civic center projects.)

RALEIGH, NORTH CAROLINA

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

No comprehensive city plan. Public interest in general city improvements for the most part created through addresses by the Mayor to the Chamber of Commerce.

REPORTS:

Robinson, Charles Mulford. A city plan for Raleigh, a report to the Civic Department of the Woman's Club of Raleigh. 1913.

READING, PENNSYLVANIA

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

There is a comprehensive city plan prepared 1864 to date, in accordance with which improvements are carried out: sewers, paving, street openings, parks, etc. City Council action is municipal authority. Difficulties encountered with a few structures to be destroyed. Popular interest aroused by newspapers and various civic organizations such as Rotary, Chamber of Commerce, etc.

REPORTS:

Nolen, John. Replanning Reading, an industrial city of a hundred thousand. Boston, 1910. (Report to Civic Association.)

RIDGEWOOD, NEW JERSEY

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

Partial city plan, recently prepared by survey. Street widening has been carried out. Commission is municipal authority. No difficulties as yet, public appreciative, interest having been created through the press.

REPORTS:

Robinson, Charles Mulford. The improvement of Ridgewood. Report to the Board of Trade. 1908.

ROANOKE, VIRGINIA

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

The city has never had prepared a comprehensive city plan.

REPORTS:

Nolen, John. Remodelling Roanoke; report to the Committee on Civic Improvement. 1907.

ROCHESTER, NEW YORK

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

A partial plan was prepared by a Committee of the Chamber of Commerce. A comprehensive plan is to be prepared

through the City Planning Bureau. Quite a number of the suggestions made by the 1911 Committee, such as street extensions, have been carried out. City Planning Bureau and Common Council action form municipal authority for city planning. "Any public improvement requiring an appropriation is presented to the Common Council in the form of an ordinance, when public hearings will be held. The Chamber of Commerce and other local associations have been of great service in getting favorable action by the Council. They also help create public sentiment in favor of needed improvements. ...I believe a Bureau organized as ours is is well adapted to the actual carrying out of a definite city plan. Our plan...provides that the executive officer of the City Planning Bureau shall be appointed by the City Administration, and that the appropriations for carrying on the work of the Bureau are made by the City the same as for any other department or bureau. It also provides for the advice, and approval of plans by a Board of citizens. The plan thus combines the two general methods of carrying on city planning, namely, one directly by the City Administration, and the other by citizens outside the administrative offices."—Edwin A. Fisher, Superintendent of City Planning.

REPORTS:

Wallace, J. F., G. N. Swain, and B. J. Arnold. Report of Committee of experts appointed to investigate suggested sites for new passenger station of New York Central & Hudson River Railroad at Rochester. 1909.

Brunner, Arnold W., Frederick Law Olmsted, and Bion J. Arnold. A city plan for Rochester; a report prepared for the Rochester Civic Improvement Committee. New York, 1911.

Arnold, Bion J. Report on car operation and routing, New York State Railways, Rochester Lines, to the Rochester Chamber of Commerce. 1916.

Rochester Bureau of Municipal Research, Inc. A municipal reconstruction program, suggesting certain steps that may be taken to plan for the after-the-war Rochester. October, 1918.

Rochester Bureau of City Planning. Organization of the Bureau. 1919.

----Rules and regulations relating to laying out, dedication and acceptance of streets, etc. 1919.

----Rules and regulations for use districts. Adopted September 22, 1919. Amended November 26, 1919.

ROCKFORD, ILLINOIS

DIGEST OF ANSWER:
Comprehensive plan prepared by Mr. West of Chicago, through voluntary contributions, then adopted by ordinance. Street openings have been carried out. Common Council the authority. Expense a difficulty, but public appreciative. Interest created by showing general benefits.

REPORTS:

West, Myron H. Plan for the improvement and extension of Rockford. Published by American Park Builders, Chicago, 1918.

SACRAMENTO, CALIFORNIA

No answer received.

REPORTS:

California State Capital Planning Commission. Report of Commission upon its investigation of the planning of the capital of California. September, 1916. (Contains summaries of reports by Messrs. Robinson, Hegemann, and Nolen, separately called in as advisers.)

SAINT LOUIS, MISSOURI

DIGEST OF ANSWER:
A comprehensive plan is in course of preparation by the City Plan Commission, by municipal appropriation. (Harland Bartholomew, engineer). Improvements have been carried out according to plan: street plans, zoning ordinance, (water front imrovement), and recreation projects. Difficulties have lain in lack of appreciation of city's widest needs, but the public now appreciates the value of such plans, having been educated continuously by reports (chiefly), and lectures.

REPORTS:

St. Louis Kingshighway Commission. Report. 1903.

St. Louis Public Buildings Commission. Report to the Mayor. 1904.

Civic League of St. Louis. Preliminary reports of Civic Centers Committee. 1906.

____A city plan for St. Louis; reports of the several committees appointed by the executive board of the Civic League to draft a city plan. 1907.

City Plan Association, St. Louis. Report. April 1, 1911.

St. Louis City Plan Commission. Central traffic-parkway, recommended July, 1912, and Charter amendment, January, 1913.

____The river front. Possible municipal ownership of a railway from Chain of Rocks to River des Peres, with additional approach to municipal bridge. April, 1913. (Also published with River front report, 1915.)

____Five possible locations and comparative cost of proposed river terminals. 1914.

____Central traffic-parkway of St. Louis. Ordinance passed by the Municipal Assembly. February, 1915.

____The river front. Proposed terminals for boats and railroads. March 1, 1915.

____River des Peres plan. Concrening largely the industrial and residential expansion and economic welfare of St. Louis, prepared in conjunction with (several city departments and submitted to) Board of Public Service. 1916.

Citizens' City Plan Committee. Bulletin no. 2. February 11, 1916.

St. Louis City Plan Commission. (Harland Bartholomew, engineer.) Preliminary statement on districting, a reasonable exercise of the police power for health, safety and general welfare. July, 1916.

____Annual report. 1916-1917. (First published annual report of Commission created 1911.)

____Problems of St. Louis, being a description from the city-planning standpoint, of past and present tendencies of growth with general suggestions for impending issues and necessary future improvements.

St. Louis City Plan Commission. The Kingshighway; a report. January, 1917. (For completion of the project treated in the 1903 report.)

----A major street plan for St. Louis. May, 1917.

----Recreation in St. Louis. November, 1917. Published January, 1918.

----Zoning for St. Louis; a fundamental part of the city plan. January, 1918.

----City of St. Louis, height, area, and use districts and restrictions. May, 1918.

----St. Louis after the war; with an introduction by Winston Churchill. 1918.

----Twelfth Street, St. Louis' most needed commercial thoroughfare. May, 1919.

----The zone plan. June, 1919.

----A public building group plan for St. Louis. 1919.

----The housing problem in St. Louis. June, 1920.

SAINT PAUL, MINNESOTA

No answer received. (City Planning Board secured appropriation of $50,000 (Spring 1920) to be expended for surveys and a plan. George H. Herrold was appointed managing director and engineer of the Board.)

REPORTS:

St. Paul Capitol Approaches Commission. Report to the Common Council. 1906.

Stickney, A. B. A comprehensive system of parks for the city of St. Paul as proposed by A. B. Stickney, Chairman of the Citizens' Committee consisting of one hundred and fifty citizens to plan a comprehensive system of parks. 1911.

SALEM, MASSACHUSETTS

No answer received. (There is a Planning Board under compulsory State law of 1913. Some improvements have been carried out.)

REPORTS:

Salem City Plans Commission. First annual report. 1912.

SAN DIEGO, CALIFORNIA

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

Comprehensive plan was prepared by John Nolen, but improvements have not been carried out—"more lack of initiative, possibly, than anything else. No concerted movement to carry out Nolen plan." Those of public who have investigated its merits appreciate plan. Popular interest in general city improvements is created through Chamber of Commerce, Cabrillo Commercial Club, various women's clubs and improvement clubs. Common Council is present municipal authority for improvements.

REPORTS:

Nolen, John. San Diego, a comprehensive plan for its improvement. Boston, 1908. (Report to Civic Improvement Committee.)

SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA

No answer received. [Civic center partly constructed.]

REPORTS:

Burnham, Daniel Hudson. Report on a plan for San Francisco, by D. H. Burnham assisted by Edward H. Bennett. Presented to the Mayor and Board of Supervisors by the Association for the Improvement and Adornment of San Francisco. Ed. by Edward F. O'Day. September, 1905.

Manson, Marsden. Report to the Mayor and Committee on Reconstruction of San Francisco, on the improvements now necessary to execute, and an estimate of the same. 1906.

Wagoner, Luther, and **W. H. Heuer.** San Francisco harbor; its commerce and docks, with a complete plan for development, being the report of the engineers of the Federated Harbor Improvement Associations. 1908.

Arnold, Bion J. Report on the improvement and development of the transportation facilities of San Francisco. Submitted to the Mayor and Board of Supervisors. 1913.

SAN JOSE, CALIFORNIA

DIGEST OF ANSWER:
No comprehensive city plan, but preparation of one anticipated through Chamber of Commerce. There is a lack of education and public appreciation.

REPORTS:

Robinson, Charles Mulford. The beautifying of San José. A report to the Outdoor Art League. 1909.

SANTA BARBARA, CALIFORNIA

DIGEST OF ANSWER:
"In 1909, Charles Mulford Robinson, at the instigation and expense of local bodies, reported a plan for the beautification of Santa Barbara. This has never been acted upon officially nor have we a City Plan Commission. Many of his suggestions, however, have in practice, been followed in municipal improvements. Within the last year, there has been some further agitation for a Commission, which will now undoubtedly materialize."—Mayor.

REPORTS:

Robinson, Charles Mulford. Report to Mayor regarding the civic affairs of Santa Barbara. Also the report of the Committee of Eleven on the Improvement of the city streets. Santa Barbara, Civic League. 1909.

SANTA FE, NEW MEXICO

DIGEST OF ANSWER:
No comprehensive city plan, but preparation of one anticipated by cooperation between City Council and various civic organizations. Under present city administration (since April 1918) many improvements have been made, not entirely according to a plan. City Council action is municipal authority. Difficulties in lack of appreciation and cooperation on part of property owners. Public seems to "like the medicine better after they 'get it down.'"

REPORTS:

Santa Fé City Planning Board. Plan for proposed improvements. 1913.

SEATTLE, WASHINGTON

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

A comprehensive plan was prepared by V. G. Bogue in 1911 for the Municipal Plans Commission (of thirty members), but the plan was not officially adopted when submitted to popular vote. However, several main thoroughfares have been laid out and acquired substantially in accordance with the plan. The proposed civic center has not been acquired. An amendment to the City Charter provided for the creation of a Municipal Plans Commission. Although the public does not appreciate the value of plan, it has been helpful to the city authorities. Public is interested in general city improvements by allowing ample time for hearings before City Council, which are, of course reported in newspapers. On all local improvements a postal card notice is mailed to each property owner, in addition to the publication of the notice.

REPORTS:

Olmsted Brothers. Report on a comprehensive system of parks and parkways for Seattle, published in Park Commissioners First Report 1884-1904. Supplemental report on Annexed territory and general development in Commissioners' Report of 1909.

Seattle Municipal Plans Commission. Plan of Seattle. Report of the Commission, submitting report of Virgil G. Bogue, engineer. 1911.

SPOKANE, WASHINGTON

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

The preparation of a comprehensive city plan is proceeding by employment of expert (C. H. Cheney) as consultant to work with City Engineer and City Plan Commission (created by City Ordinance). Work has not progressed far enough to meet with special difficulties. Interest being created by articles in daily papers and addresses by City Plan experts before Chamber of Commerce and other public gatherings.

REPORTS:

Olmsted Brothers. Report for a park system in Spokane, 1908. Published in Spokane Board of Park Commissioners Report for 1891-1913.

SPRINGFIELD, MASSACHUSETTS

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

Comprehensive plan not yet worked out but has been under consideration for several years, while City Planning Board was organized and in operation (temporarily discontinued). Further action anticipated when new Planning Board is appointed, which may cooperate with Board of Survey. Improvements only to a limited extent in accordance with a plan. City Council is authority for improvements, acting on recommendations from Board of Public Works. Difficulties encountered seem to be mainly financial. Public believed to be appreciative. Chamber of Commerce and press more or less active in these matters.

REPORTS:

Springfield City Planning Commission. First annual report, 1914, contains analysed plan of procedure and statistical survey.

STILLWATER, MINNESOTA

No answer received.

REPORTS:

Stillwater Park Board. Plan of Stillwater; prepared under the direction of the Park Board. Morell & Nichols. Minneapolis, 1918.

SYRACUSE, NEW YORK

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

"Syracuse has a comprehensive plan which is used by the Planning Commission as a guide. However this plan has not been presented to the Common Council for adoption or approval pending certain railroad adjustments which will determine important changes in plan. This plan has been in the process of preparation since 1914 under the direction of the City Planning Commission and its consultant, C. E. Howard, Architect and City Planner." City Planning Commission authorized by Common Council under State Act of 1913. Some improvements have already been carried out. Difficulties are financial and political, and the lack of a complete public understanding of the subject. There is, however, appreciation among those who have any interest in civic matters. News-

paper publicity used, also lectures and cooperation with such organizations as the Chamber of Commerce, the Real Estate Board and the Bankers Association.

REPORTS:

(Note: a series of ten articles on Syracuse opportunities, by Charles Mulford Robinson, appeared in Syracuse Herald October 7-November 15, 1905.)

Mische, Emmanuel Tillman. The beautification of Syracuse. Published in Syracuse Chamber of Commerce Bulletin, 1906.

Syracuse Grade Crossing Commission. Report on grade crossing elimination in Syracuse; findings of the Commission and report of Bion J. Arnold, consulting engineer. 1917.

Syracuse City Planning Commission. City planning for Syracuse. 1919.

TRENTON, NEW JERSEY

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

City has a plan based on preliminary surveys made in 1917 by landscape and municipal engineers. A complete survey anticipated within next year or so. The preliminary plan was adopted with the understanding that at a later date a complete survey of the city would be authorized. Three street widenings and extension projects, establishment of community parks, and new cross-town boulevard are being carried out according to plan. Municipal authority is by Commission Government Act with partial home rule authority. Difficulties found in lack of adequate home rule power delegated to municipal governing board by State Legislature. Public apparently appreciates value of plans, since at election on November 4, 1919, voters approved referendum questions for new cross-town boulevard (covering over lower Assanpink) and enlarged system of parks. Campaigns of public education are carried on after projected improvements have been favorably considered by City Commission. Methods employed include newspaper advertisements, reports, etc., and special circular issued by Mayor to citizens explaining and illustrating his project.

REPORTS:

Olmsted Brothers. Report to the Special Committee on the Acquisition of Park Lands, Trenton, concerning the physical conditions of that portion of the valley of the Assanpink lying within the corporate limits of the City. 1907. (Proposed parking the Assanpink.)

UTICA, NEW YORK

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

"Utica has just taken up the question of City Planning, a commission of nine members having been appointed by me to provide for the future development of our city according to a definite plan and the correction of existing faults. This commission has not organized as yet, but I expect that it will enter upon its duties shortly. It is appointed under authority of a special act of the Legislature passed in 1913, and I feel it will prove one of the most beneficial municipal undertakings ever brought about in this city."—James D. Smith, Mayor. November 8, 1919.

REPORTS:

Utica Chamber of Commerce. Report of the committee on Improving and Beautifying Utica. 1908. (Plans by F. L. Olmsted.)

WALPOLE, MASSACHUSETTS

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

Comprehensive town plan by John Nolen. Several improvements carried out according to plan. Municipal authority is town meeting. Popular interest in improvements created by discussion. Apparently public appreciative. Town Planning Committee (advisory) was appointed at town meeting March 1920, to advance the plan. Improvements are recommended by committee to town meeting for passage.

REPORTS:

Walpole Town Planning Committee. Walpole—plan today for tomorrow. Plans for the Committee, by John Nolen. 1914.

WASHINGTON, DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

Comprehensive plan for Washington originally prepared by Major L'Enfant under direction of President Washington was

made definitive and effective about 1893 by Board created by Congress. All street extensions since 1893 at least have been required to conform thereto. Parkways and parks also conform to plans established under authority of Congress. Operating authority is a commission, two commissioners appointed by the President, and one detailed by the Secretary of War from the Corps of Engineers, U. S. Army. No difficulties inherent in the plans have been encountered. A zone plan greatly needed. (Preparations since authorized by Congress —Harland Bartholomew, consultant.) Public decidedly appreciative. The citizens' association, press, chamber of commerce, etc., do much to create popular interest. Each citizens' association corresponds to a certain area of the District. In the winter of 1919 a campaign was held to make every citizen a member of some citizens' association.

REPORTS*:

U. S. Office of Public Buildings and Grounds. Plans for treatment of that portion of the District of Columbia south of Pennsylvania avenue and north of B street SW., and for a connection between Potomac and Zoological parks. Letter from the Secretary of War, transmitting, with a letter from the Chief of Engineers, report of examination and estimates of cost. 1900.

Papers relating to the improvement of Washington, D. C. Compiled by Glenn Brown, Secretary of the American Institute of Architects; with an introduction by Charles Moore, clerk of Senate committee on the District of Columbia. 1901.

U. S. Congress. Senate. Committee on the District of Columbia. The improvement of the park system of the District of Columbia. I.—Report of Senate Committee on District of Columbia. II.—Report of the Park Commission. Edited by Charles Moore. 1902. (Action of the Washington Board of Trade in relation to the park system of the District of Columbia, compiled by Charles Moore, published 1903.)

Park improvement papers. Being a series of papers relating to the improvement of the District of Columbia. Edited and compiled by Charles Moore. 1903.

District of Columbia Harbor Committee. Improvement of the harbor front of Washington. 1908.

U. S. Commission of Fine Arts. Annual report for 1916. Published 1917. (Contains summary of the work of Commission since establishment in 1910, especially in relation to "Park Commission" Plan. See also 1918-19 Report.)

U. S. Senate Document No. 362 (64th Congress, 1st session.) Data relating to the construction of a central heating, lighting, and power plant on the Mall in Washington, together with supplemental papers thereon. 1916.

U. S. Office of Public Buildings and Grounds. Development of East Potomac Park. Letter from the Secretary of War **ad interim** transmitting a report of the officer in charge of public buildings and grounds, presenting a comprehensive plan for the development of East Potomac Park as a public recreation ground. 1916. (64th Congress, 1st session, House Doc. 1038.)

U. S. Senate. Public Buildings Commission. Report pursuant to certain provisions of the sundry civil appropriation act, approved July 1, 1916, authorizing the appointment of a commission to investigate and ascertain what public buildings are needed to provide permanent quarters for all the government activities in the District of Columbia. Presented by Mr. Martin, December 18, 1917. Published 1918. 65th Congress, 2d session. Senate Doc. no. 155.

*(Published by Government Printing Office, Washington.)

WATERBURY, CONNECTICUT

No answer received.

REPORTS:

Nolen, John. Housing needs of workingmen and proposed methods of providing for them. Report and recommendations made to Waterbury Housing Committee. Published as Waterbury Housing Report, supplement to Sunday Republican, September 3, 1916.

WATERLOO, IOWA

DIGEST OF ANSWER:

Improvements have been carried out according to a plan. Common Council is municipal authority.

REPORTS:

Robinson, Charles Mulford. The wellbeing of Waterloo. Report to the Civic Society of Waterloo. 1910.

WATERTOWN, NEW YORK

No answer received.

REPORTS:

Robinson, Charles Mulford. Watertown possibilities. 1907. (Report to Municipal Improvement League.)

WINCHESTER, MASSACHUSETTS

No answer received. (Certain stream improvements carried out, and there is active Planning Board appointed under 1913 State Act.)

REPORTS:

Kellaway, Herbert J. Report upon Mystic Valley improvement, along the Aberjona River. 1911. (Report to Waterways Improvement Committee of Winchester.)

WORCESTER, MASSACHUSETTS

No answer received.

REPORTS:

Worcester Commission on Relief of Street Congestion. Final report and recommendations made to the Mayor and City Council. December, 1911.

SUPPLEMENT

MUNICIPAL APPROPRIATIONS FOR CITY PLANNING IN 1920

Compiled by Flavel Shurtleff, Secretary, National Conference on City Planning.

Only such appropriations are listed as are made for the express use of official city plan commissions. Wherever the information received permitted, a brief note is given as to the use to which the appropriation was put, but in general it is true that commissions with very small appropriations are for the most part purely advisory boards and spend the money appropriated for clerical help and supplies, the chief item of which is printing. Several cities which appropriate large sums each year for city planning are not found in the following list because the money is spent by other agencies than city planning commissions.

Akron, Ohio—$19,000—engineering staff consisting of two draftsmen and eight engineers, and expert service.

Allentown, Pa.—$800, surveys—$500, office expenses.

Altoona, Pa.—$1,000.

Arlington, Mass.—$500—clerical staff and supplies.

Boston, Mass.—$7,500, engineering and clerical staff and supplies—$2,000, housing survey.

Buffalo, N. Y.—$18,940—salaries of engineering staff, for clerical assistance and for supplies.

Brookline, Mass.—$600, clerical staff and supplies; $1,500, for a special intensive study.

Cleveland, Ohio—$28,580—expert fees, engineering and clerical staff and ordinary office expenses.

Dayton, Ohio—$250.

Detroit, Mich—$35,000, salaries of engineering staff and clerical expenses—$6,000, consultant's fees—$4,000, ordinary office expenses.

Easton, Pa.—$600.

Erie, Pa.—$500.

East Orange, N. J.—$750—expert service.

Framingham, Mass.—$500—preliminary survey and ordinary office expenses.

Gardner, Mass.—$4,500—expert service in preparing a comprehensive plan.

Harrisburg, Pa.—$2,634.

Johnstown, Pa.—$670—clerical staff and office expense.

Kansas City, Mo.—$25,000—engineering staff, consulting expert, office expense.

Milwaukee, Wis.—$17,290, engineering staff—$10,000, expert fees— $6,500, office expenses.

Palo Alto, Calif.—$200—office expenses.

Pittsburgh, Pa.—$30,000.

Quincy, Mass.—$250—office expenses.

Rochester, N. Y.—$17,300, engineering and clerical staff—$4,500, expert fees—$3,600, surveys and maps.

San José, Cal.—$2,000—in 1917 for preliminary maps.

Scranton, Pa.—$1,000—clerical help and office expense.

Somerville, Mass.—$200—office expenses.

Syracuse, N. Y.—$5,000—engineering staff, clerical expenses and other office expenses.

St. Louis, Mo.—$19,160—engineering and clerical staff and ordinary office expenses.

St. Paul, Minn—$13,000, engineering staff—$8,000, expert fees —$4,000, clerical expenses and ordinary office expense.

Spokane, Wash.—$3,600, consulting expert—$1,650, maps and office expense.

Taunton, Mass.—$200—supplies.

Wilkes-Barre, Pa.—$1,500—engineering service and ordinary office expense.

York, Pa.—$2,500—making survey of the territory adjoining the city.

All who are Interested in orderly city development are invited to join the **National Conference on City Planning.** Annual memberships in The Conference are of three classes: organization, usually applied for by Chambers of Commerce and other civic organizations, at $25.00; sustaining, either individual or organization, at $10.00; individual membership, $5.00. Members will receive, without charge, copies of all literature published by the Conference during the year, including the bound volume of the Conference Proceedings, and will be entitled to a special discount on publications of the Conference of other years, and publications issued under its auspices.

All communications relating to membership or publications should be addressed to the Secretary of the Conference, Flavel Shurtleff, 60 State St., Boston.

Special Publications.

CLASSIFIED SELECTED LIST OF REFERENCES ON CITY PLANNING, 50 Cents

This list of about 1000 references was prepared in 1915 by Theodora Kimball. A limited supply of copies are still available. It will not be superseded by the proposed Manual mentioned below.

MANUAL OF REFERENCES ON CITY PLANNING

In preparation by Theodora Kimball, to be published under the auspices of the Conference at $1.50, as soon as a sufficient number of advance subscriptions is assured. This will contain a comprehensive bibliography of the most useful references on city planning with especial attention to American experiences, and will supplement the Selected List of 1915. Subscription orders should be sent to the Secretary of the Conference.

PRINCIPLES OF CITY PLANNING

Introductory Statement, by Frederick Law Olmsted. (Publication No. 1 of the American City Planning Institute.) This paper will be supplied in quantities of 10 or more at 5 cents a copy.

MUNICIPAL ACCOMPLISHMENT IN CITY PLANNING AND PUBLISHED CITY PLAN REPORTS IN THE UNITED STATES

Price of this bulletin, 40 cents.

RETURN TO ⟶ **CIRCULATION DEPARTMENT**
202 Main Library

LOAN PERIOD 1 **HOME USE**	2	3
4	5	6

ALL BOOKS MAY BE RECALLED AFTER 7 DAYS
1-month loans may be renewed by calling 642-3405
6-month loans may be recharged by bringing books to Circulation Desk
Renewals and recharges may be made 4 days prior to due date

DUE AS STAMPED BELOW

AUG 20 1981

REC CIRC MAR 12 1985

FEB 26 1987
AUTO. DISC.

AUG 25 1986

~~FEB 26 1990~~
~~LIBRARY LOAN~~

JAN 22 1990

UNIV. OF CALIF. BERK.

UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA, BERKELEY
FORM NO. DD6, 60m, 3/80 BERKELEY, CA 94720

GENERAL LIBRARY - U.C. BERKELEY

B001000767